## Michigan Green Jobs Report

## Occupations \& Employment in the New Green Economy



# Michigan Green Jobs Report 2009 <br> Occupations \& Employment in the New Green Economy 



## Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Bureau Of Labor Market Information \& Strategic Initiatives
MAY 2009

Prepared By:
Bureau Of Labor Market Information And Strategic Initiatives
Richard Waclawek
Director
Bruce Weaver
Project Manager

Rhea Acuna
Jeffery Anderson
James Astalos
Jacob Bisel
Leonidas Murembya
Jason Palmer
Mark Reffitt
Stephen Woods

For Further Information, Please Contact:

## Contents

Executive Summary. ..... 4
Employer Survey Results ..... 4
Green Related Industry Trend Analysis ..... 6
Green Related Firm Trends .....  6
Occupational Trends .....  6
Letter from Governor ..... 8
Introduction ..... 9
The Potential of Michigan’s Green Economy ..... 9
Defining Green Jobs ..... 10
Michigan's Research Approach ..... 11
Quantitative Approach-Michigan Green Jobs Survey11
Analytical Approach-Examination of Industries and Occupations ..... 11
Qualitative Approach-Michigan Focus Groups ..... 11
Existing Research Studies on Michigan Green Jobs ..... 12
Chapter I: Michigan Green Jobs
Survey Results ..... 13
Green Jobs Core Areas Definitions ..... 14
Survey Results: Direct Green Jobs by Detailed Industry ..... 16
Survey Results: Green Jobs by Detailed Occupation ..... 19
Survey Results: Employer Expectations ..... 24
Hiring ..... 24
Filling Vacancies ..... 25
Unique Skills ..... 25
Training. ..... 27
Chapter II: Green-Related Industries in the Michigan Economy ..... 28
Green-related Industry Analysis- Understanding the Data ..... 28
Employment in Michigan's Green Clusters ..... 29
Broad Cluster Analysis-Location Quotients. ..... 33
Job Change in Green-Related Industries ..... 34
Michigan's Competitive Employment Performance in Green-related Industries ..... 36
Wages in Green-related Industry Clusters ..... 38
Wages in Detailed Green and Green-related Industries ..... 39
Chapter III: Tracking Job Trends among Green-Related Firms ..... 42
Understanding the Data ..... 42
Job Trends among Green-Related Firms ..... 42
Comparison to Michigan Broad Industry Sectors ..... 45
Green-related Firm Sample by Industry ..... 45
Chapter IV: Michigan Green-Related Occupations ..... 47
Characteristics of Occupations ..... 47
Identifying Green Related Occupations ..... 47
Forecasts for Green-Related Occupations ..... 48
Green Occupations: Educational \& Training Requirements ..... 49
Green Occupations: Career Progressions ..... 51
Green Occupations: Wages ..... 54
Green Occupations: Critical Skills and Knowledge Sets ..... 55
Conclusion ..... 61
Public Policy and Green Jobs ..... 61
What the Future Holds: ..... 61
Renewable Energy Area ..... 62
Energy Efficiency ..... 62
Batteries ..... 62
Appendix 1 - Survey ..... 63
Appendix 2 - Survey Methodology ..... 65
Appendix 3 - Definition of Green Jobs and Core Areas Sent to Employers ..... 66
Appendix 4 - List of Green Related Industries Reflected in Chapter II ..... 68
Appendix 5 - List of Green Related Occupations Reflected in Chapter IV ..... 71

## Executive Summary

The new green economy provides Michigan a dynamic opportunity to rebuild the state's job base, attract new investment, and diversify the state's economy. We may be at a tipping point of awareness, understanding, and opportunities that a green economy can provide for Michigan's workforce, businesses, and communities.

But what exactly is the green economy, and what is a green job? How many presently exist, and what are the prospects for growth? This report represents Michigan's first attempt to provide rigorous, empirical answers to these questions so important to our economic future.

Michigan defines green jobs as jobs directly involved in generating or supporting a firm's greenrelated products or services. The state's green economy is defined as being comprised of industries that provide products or services in five areas:

1. Agriculture and natural resource conservation;
2. Clean transportation and fuels;
3. Increased energy efficiency;
4. Pollution prevention or environmental cleanup; and
5. Renewable energy production.

The Michigan Green Jobs Study used a threepronged methodology that included quantitative, analytical and qualitative research. The quantitative work involved a survey sent to thousands of employers to uncover private sector green job trends.
This marks the first attempt in Michigan to survey employers directly in order to measure the current number of Michigan green jobs. The analytical work involved merging labor market information and economic intelligence with survey results to uncover industry and occupational trends. The qualitative approach involved using focus groups to enhance our understanding of green-related workforce issues.

These three research methods were integrated into the findings and conclusions contained in this report.

We plan to produce a series of reports over time to track developments in Michigan's green economy.

## What we found:

## Michigan boasts 109,067 total green jobs-both direct and support positions-among private sector employers. There are 96,767 direct green jobs and $\mathbf{1 2 , 3 0 0}$ support green jobs. This is big news, but it also shows the potential for growth of the green economy. Michigan's overall private sector employment is 3.2 million; green jobs are currently 3 percent of that total. ${ }^{1}$

## Employer Survey Results

Through the employer survey, we categorized direct green jobs in Michigan into five core areas. The Clean Transportation and Fuels area comprises just over 40 percent - close to 40,000 jobs - of all green jobs. Nearly one quarter of green jobs were attributable to the Energy Efficiency core area, and most of the positions were associated with the state's construction industry. This distribution reflects Michigan's large automotive and construction sectors. Green jobs were most common in these specific industries: Transportation Equipment Manufacturing (25,780 jobs), Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services (22,178 jobs), Specialty Trade Contractors (9825 jobs), and Construction of Buildings (3,571 jobs).

[^0]

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

From an occupational perspective, over 70 percent of direct green workers fall into three broad categories:

- Production occupations ( 28 percent)
- Engineering occupations (24 percent)
- Construction occupations (19 percent)

Over one-third of the positions in the Clean Transportation and Fuels Core area were engineers, and a large portion of the remainder were production positions such as assemblers or machinists. In Energy Efficiency, the two most common occupations were related to construction: HVAC installers and General maintenance workers. Farmworkers made up a quarter of green jobs in Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation, while various kinds of engineers and environmental specialists were important in the Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup core area. The Renewable Energy Production core area has the most diverse mix of green occupations, employing engineers, technicians, mechanics, and production staff.

The survey asked employers to outline their expected hiring needs for the next two years. Growth occupations most frequently cited include engineers, skilled trades, and certain technical specialist job titles. The occupations cited span a variety of education and skill levels.

Despite the need for some specialized green skills, employers in the focus groups stressed that workers still need the basics. Green skills are an overlay of new skills and knowledge; and learners cannot access the new knowledge without the requisite foundation. Skills in science, technology, engineering and math will be important, and positions with these skills may be most difficult to fill. Nearly 70 percent of employers in the survey said training their green-related workers would be workplace-based as they looked to upgrade or enhance current workers' knowledge. This finding reinforces the importance of career ladders for current and incoming workers.

## Green Related Industry Trend Analysis

To gather additional information not captured by the employer survey, Michigan identified over 100 industries considered to be green related. Not all jobs in these industries are green jobs, but these are sectors that could potentially benefit from an expansion of the Michigan green economy. Green related industries have recorded job losses since 2004, like the rest of the Michigan economy, but several specific green related industries have added jobs: Semiconductor Manufacturing, Recyclable Material Wholesalers, and Environmental Consulting Services.

A handful of detailed green-related sectors in Michigan are not only relatively highly concentrated in terms of jobs, but also managed to record employment growth from 2004 to 2008. Process \& logistics consulting firms, which offer operating advice and assistance in areas such as manufacturing operations improvement, productivity, production planning, and quality assurance, were 44 percent more concentrated in Michigan than in the United States in the second quarter of 2008. Employment in this industry was up nearly four percent since 2004. Firms in the business of Industrial design services have also recorded employment expansion since 2004, and are highly concentrated in the Michigan economy. Taken as a whole, the green-related industries selected for this study comprise a higher share of total jobs in Michigan than is true of the national economy.

Not all jobs in these green-related sectors are currently generated by the green economy. However, if green business expands in the state, many existing Michigan firms in these sectors could have the expertise to diversify into green business activities.

## Green Related Firm Trends

Michigan analyzed a small sample of 358 green related firms' trends over a three year period to shed light on potential employment trends. While findings from this analysis are intriguing, they are indicators only and cannot be generalized to the health of all green-related firms in Michigan given the sample size. Firms in the Renewable Energy Production cluster added nearly 1,900 jobs from 2005 to 2008 , a growth rate of 30 percent. This finding is an indicator that firms in this cluster are the most likely to experience job growth, even though they represent less than 10 percent of the overall green jobs in Michigan. Renewable Energy Production includes areas like wind and solar manufacturing and installation.

The sample also suggests that green-related firms may be a significant source of entrepreneurial activity. Of the 358 sample firms, 70 appear to have been newly created since 2005, creating 600 jobs - a much higher rate of startups than is seen in the overall Michigan economy. In all, the sample firms added more than 2,500 jobs, an impressive employment expansion of 7.7 percent (the total Michigan average was negative 5.4 percent). This small segment of the green economy far outpaced employment trends for the Michigan economy as a whole.

## Occupational Trends

Green jobs can be found across the spectrum of broad occupational categories, such as professional workers with specific skill sets directly needed by green-related firms; production, maintenance, and transportation occupations; critical occupations for small start-up green-related firms, such as sales engineers or technical sales representatives; and jobs in teaching or training that will be needed to prepare

## Green Jobs in Michigan-

The opportunity to create new Michigan jobs rests overwhelmingly with the clean energy, green-collar economy. We know the combination of these targeted efforts, coupled with the determination of Michigan's workers' to embrace the green economy, will help transform our state.

the future green-related workforce. Green-related occupations with above average expected job growth rates include engineering, professional and mid-skill mechanic and laborer positions. Careers in greenrelated occupations exist at all levels of educational attainment. This sample career progression in the renewable energy area illustrates the job potential in green.

Green-related industries hold the potential for workers to earn above average wage rates. Thirteen of the top 15 broad industries in terms of green jobs paid more than the private sector average weekly wage of $\$ 811$, while ten were well above this average (at least $\$ 100$ per week more). Furthermore, eight of the top 15 green industries paid more than $\$ 1,000$ per week, or over $\$ 50,000$ per year.

What the Future Holds: The opportunity to create new Michigan jobs rests overwhelmingly with the clean energy, green-collar economy. With our advanced manufacturing expertise, our depth of engineering talent, and our local access to original equipment manufacturers (OEMs) and suppliers, we are poised to create tens of thousands of good-paying green jobs for Michigan workers. In the renewable energy sector, Michigan has the potential to become a regional and global powerhouse in wind turbine
manufacturing with Michigan's engineering expertise and modernized machining. Investments in energy efficiency represent a major opportunity for Michigan to create jobs, save money, and reduce our reliance on fossil fuels. By replacing traditional fossil fuel energy, Michigan's energy efficiency program will save Michigan over $\$ 3$ billion in electricity costs over the next 20 years. Advanced energy storage, and in particular the production of lithium ion batteries for cars, holds enormous potential for job creation in Michigan. Michigan is rapidly becoming a center for advanced energy storage innovation aimed at, among other things, electrifying the automobile.

We know the combination of these targeted efforts, coupled with the determination of Michigan's workers to embrace the green economy, will help transform our state.

## For More Information-

Bureau of labor Market Information \& Strategic Initiatives Labor Market Analysis Section
3032 W. Grand Boulevard, Suite 9-100 Detroit, Ml 48202
(313) 456-3100

WWW.MICHIGAN.GOV

## Letter from Governor

SENNIFER M. GRANHOLM
GOVERNOR OFFICE OF THE GOVERNOR MiCHIGAN

JOHN D. CHERRY, JR.

LT. GOVERNOR

May 11, 2009

## Dear Friends:

These are both challenging and exciting times as we work to transform Michigan into the nation's leading green state. Our aggressive efforts to grow a renewable energy industry in Michigan will create jobs, diversify our economy, help break our dependence on foreign oil and fossil fuels, and create healthier communities for us and future generations.

We are seeing new green industries take hold in Michigan because of our abundant renewable resources, our research and development initiatives, our advanced manufacturing experience, and especially because of our highly skilled workforce. In conjunction with our unparalleled economic development incentives, these assets are making Michigan the renewable energy hub of North America and the advanced-battery capital of the world.

Our Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) and our goal to reduce fossil fuels by 45 percent by 2020 are also driving investment and the creation of green jobs. By aggressively pursuing advanced energy storage, wind and solar technologies, biofuels, geothermal, and other green industries, Michigan stands to create tens of thousands of new green jobs for Michigan citizens.

No state can match our Green Jobs Initiative that supports employers by meeting their worker training needs in emerging renewable energy and green jobs industries. The findings in this report, provided by Michigan employers, are instrumental in helping us capture our full potential in the green economy, and we thank them for their invaluable input.

Michigan's move to a clean energy, green economy will create all kinds of jobs for all kinds of people. These are the jobs that will reshape our economy and accelerate our recovery.


Jennifer M. Granholm Governor

Sincerely yours,


John D. Cherry, Jr. Lt. Governor

## Introduction

## The economic potential of the green economy has been an increasingly highprofile topic in Michigan and across the nation.

Nationally, the passage of the 2009 American Recovery and Reinvestment Act targeted the U.S. renewable energy industry and also funds investments in the weatherization of federal buildings and private housing throughout the country.

In Michigan, Governor Jennifer M. Granholm has signed legislation to increase tax incentives for the development and manufacturing of advanced batteries, and proposed a series of energy and greenrelated initiatives in her February 2009 State of the State address.

Interest has also never been higher in obtaining information on the quantity and characteristics of jobs produced by the green economy. However, private and public research organizations have only recently taken steps to attempt to define and measure green jobs for the U.S. and for individual states.

There are several reasons for this. First, traditional information sources and databases on industries and occupations are not specific enough to accurately measure the number of green jobs in the economy. In addition, a uniform definition of green jobs does not yet exist. An examination of existing studies on the topic reveals that most reports define green jobs slightly differently. This makes it difficult to conduct direct comparisons and evaluate trends using these studies.

In spite of these challenges, the need for improved information on the green economy remains high The impact of climate change, the potential health benefits from pollution prevention, the need to reduce domestic dependence on foreign oil, and the opportunity that the green sector presents for new business opportunities and job creation are all reasons for further study of this broad sector. Recognizing the importance of such issues, policymakers and industry leaders are striving to gain
a better understanding of the breadth and nature of Michigan's green economy.

The analysis that follows focuses on the green economy and the jobs, industries, and occupations that it contains. This study presents the results from the first actual survey of Michigan employers that attempts to quantify the current number of Michigan green jobs. In addition, this report utilizes existing workforce data produced by the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth to address questions regarding the characteristics of green-related sectors that were not addressed in the survey findings. This study focuses on the size and broad characteristics of current green jobs in Michigan, but will also serve as an important baseline measure for tracking future green industry growth.

## The Potential of Michigan's Green Economy

Though there is not yet a common mechanism for defining the green economy, it is clearly related to the development of new technologies that advance the production and use of clean energy, and conserve the earth's natural resources. To be green means very broadly to be in the business of developing environmentally-friendly, sustainable solutions to resource allocation and environmental challenges.

However, when it comes to developing a more precise definition of this topic, researchers typically need to focus on specific segments of the green economy.

This report defines the Michigan green economy as industries that provide products or services related to renewable energy, increased energy efficiency, clean transportation and fuels, agriculture and natural resource conservation, and pollution prevention or environmental cleanup.

If the Michigan green economy successfully expands, a variety of benefits could be realized
by the residents of Michigan. First, a greener economy would seem to be vital to a state that has many competitive advantages due to its rich natural resources. An emphasis on sustainable energy sources could help reduce the state's carbon footprint and improve air and water quality. An expansion of the green economy would also contribute to national goals to meet current and future energy needs while reducing current reliance on foreign energy sources.

Major benefits could also accrue to Michigan's workforce, as the greening of the economy holds promise for new and diverse employment opportunities. By moving the economy into renewable and clean energy solutions, Michigan will establish a more diverse industry mix-one that will be better positioned to capitalize on future high growth sectors and reduce the cyclical impact of future economic downturns. Michigan's long-term goal has been to increase the diversification of the state economy and
invest in the jobs of the future. Existing Michigan companies could benefit from expansion of the green economy by providing products, parts, and services to this potential growth sector.

## Defining Green Jobs

As indicated above, existing research studies contain many different definitions of a green job. The definitions used must be broad enough and flexible enough to encompass the very different economic activities that are often thought of as related to the green economy. However, if defined too broadly, the term "green jobs" can quickly lose relevance or can be impossible to quantify.

This study attempts to estimate the number of green jobs in the Michigan economy using an employer survey. We also evaluate the characteristics of jobs in green-related industries and occupations using existing information resources. Some of the definitions used are below:

Green Economy: Industries that provide products or services related to renewable energy, increased energy efficiency, clean transportation and fuels, agriculture and natural resource conservation, and pollution prevention or environmental cleanup.

Green Jobs: Includes primary occupations engaged in generating a firm's green-related products or services, and the other support jobs created by the firm's greenrelated revenue.

## Green-related Industry:

A detailed industry sector that is likely to contain firms that produce parts, components, products or services related to the green economy. Industries and firms were classified as green-related based on their primary product or service; not based on whether they were taking internal steps to use less energy or be more environmentally responsible.

## Green-related Occupation:

Job titles commonly utilized by green-related industries to produce products and services for the green economy. Green-related occupations can be found in a variety of educational and skill levels, such as:

- Scientists and engineers needed in energy research
- Skilled production workers utilized in a manufacturing setting
- Critical occupations at small start-up green firms, such as technical sales staff
- Construction laborers and skilled trades used in LEED construction projects


## Michigan's Research Approach

The Michigan Green Jobs Study uses a three-pronged approach to study green jobs in Michigan, which includes the following: 1) a quantitative approach, 2) an analytical approach, and a 3) qualitative approach. The quantitative approach was accomplished by the use of an employer survey, the analytical approach was done by merging labor market information and economic intelligence with survey results, and the qualitative approach used focus groups to add additional qualitative information on green-related workforce issues.


## Quantitative Approach Michigan Green Jobs Survey

In the first quarter of 2009, the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth (DELEG) conducted the Michigan Green Jobs Survey. This was the first actual attempt in Michigan to directly survey employers to measure the current number of Michigan green jobs.

The survey was a critical part of the research effort, because it quickly became apparent that it would not be possible to accurately estimate the current number of Michigan green jobs using existing information sources. The survey will also assist in identifying the share of jobs in detailed industries that are related to the green economy. The survey questions also allowed employers to classify their green workers by core green activity, and collected information regarding employer expectations of future employment levels, difficulty in hiring qualified workers, green occupations requiring unique skills, and employee training.

## Analytical Approach - Examination of Industries and Occupations

Since the employer survey content needed to be focused and targeted, the survey could not address many workforce questions regarding green industries
and occupations. As a result, the DELEG research team used existing labor market information resources to identify and study green-related industries and occupations. These resources allowed examination of the levels and trends of jobs in green-related sectors, the wage levels paid in green-related occupations, and the skills and educational requirements for certain green-related positions.

In addition to the research on industries and occupations, the research team identified over 350 green-related businesses across the state. These businesses were identified through Internet research, business resources, and public databases. As this section of the report reveals, this sample of firms, although small and not necessarily representative of the overall green economy, managed to record impressive job growth from 2005 to mid-2008 during a difficult period for the Michigan economy.

## Qualitative Approach Michigan Focus Groups

Eight focus group sessions were conducted during February and March 2009 with employers, industry experts, and educators representing various segments of the green economy. These sessions, led by staff of DELEG and the Corporation for a Skilled Workforce,
were intended to collect qualitative information on key workforce issues facing each sector, such as finding skilled workers and identifying industry training needs. The other goal of these sessions was to promote collaboration among employers through the Governor's Green Jobs Initiative. Part of this initiative includes the formation of Green Sector Skills Alliances, which will be comprised of private employers, educational providers, and other stakeholders in the green economy. These alliances will be formed to jointly tackle key workforce issues. Focus groups were held in these general industry areas:

- Agriculture and Food Systems
- Environmental Resource Management
- Green Construction
- Recycling
- Solar
- Wind


## Existing Research Studies on Michigan Green Jobs

The Michigan DELEG research staff conducted an extensive review of existing studies on the green economy during the design phase of this study. In fact, our eventual employer survey instrument was adapted from a survey design developed by the State of Washington. ${ }^{2}$

A limited number of prior studies have been conducted to attempt to measure green employment in Michigan. Just three examples are listed below.

The Center for American Progress published in September 2008 a study entitled Green Recovery - A New Program to Create Good Jobs and Start Building
a Low-Carbon Economy. This study attempted to estimate the impact on Michigan of a $\$ 3.1$ billion investment in energy efficiency and renewable energy. This was to simulate Michigan's share of a potential national green investment in energy efficiency, mass transit and freight rail, smart grid, and wind, solar and bio-fuels. The study estimated the employment impact in Michigan at 61,394 new jobs in two years, but included both green and non-green jobs.

A second study that attempted to measure green jobs in Michigan was Global Insight's 2008 report done for The United States Conference of Mayors, entitled U.S. Metro Economies - Current and Potential Green Jobs in the U.S. Economy. The report estimated the number of current green jobs among Michigan metro areas to be 12,614 , out of an estimated 751,051 jobs nationwide. The study also attempted to forecast green employment by state and estimated a potential job creation of 99,819 in Michigan by the year 2038. These job estimates were based on a set of assumptions of market forces, legislation, and local green initiatives in the U.S., and the job counts reflected direct and indirect green employment.

A third report, published in 2006 by the Renewable Energy Policy Project, was entitled Component Manufacturing: Michigan's Future in the Renewable Energy Industry. This study focused on the potential job impact of the manufacture of parts for renewable energy systems, such as wind, solar, geothermal, and biomass. It assumed an investment of $\$ 160$ billion in manufacturing industries over 10 years, and allocated shares of that investment to each state. The study estimated Michigan's job potential at 34,777 new jobs in green industries, with 70 percent in wind energy. No estimate of current Michigan green jobs was presented.


2 See 2008 Washington State Green Economy Jobs, Washington State Employment Security, January 2009

## Chapter I: Michigan Green Jobs Survey Results

A survey of employers was necessary in order to estimate the current number of green jobs in the Michigan economy. The Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth conducted a statewide employer survey during the first quarter of 2009. The sample of survey respondents, representing a broad spectrum of private industries, provided information on existing green jobs by detailed occupation in their respective firms. This section presents the survey results.

As Figure 1 indicates, an estimated 96,800 direct green jobs currently exist among Michigan private employers. Figure 1 also displays how those jobs are distributed among the five core green areas. ${ }^{3}$ Green jobs accounted for 3.4 percent of total private employment in Michigan. ${ }^{4}$ Further detailed survey results, including the primary industry sectors that generate green jobs, the occupational concentration of these jobs, and employers' future expectations regarding hiring, skills, and training are provided in the narrative that follows.

Most of the information collected in the survey reflects only "direct" green jobs; that is, employees whose primary function is the production of greenrelated products or services for a particular firm. However, the presence of green business activities in many of these firms also generates additional jobs at that particular firm for support employees. These support jobs may range from accounting staff to human services staff to clerical staff. For example, a manufacturing firm may have 20 machinists building wind turbine blades, as well as one accountant and two clerical positions that support the wind turbine

## Figure 1: Summary of Michigan Direct Green Jobs by Core Area

| Core Area | Total Direct <br> Green Jobs | Percent Share of Total <br> Direct Green Jobs |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| TOTAL DIRECT GREEN JOBS | $\mathbf{9 6 , 7 6 7}$ | $\mathbf{1 0 0 . 0 \%}$ |
| Clean Transportation and Fuels | 39,317 | $40.6 \%$ |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency | 22,236 | $23.0 \%$ |
| Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup | 12,345 | $12.8 \%$ |
| Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation | 11,986 | $12.4 \%$ |
| Renewable Energy Production | 8,843 | $9.1 \%$ |
| Green Jobs Not Assigned to a Core Area | 2,040 | $2.1 \%$ |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

[^1]business. Without the wind turbine blade revenue, the three support jobs would not exist.

The survey asked firms to attempt to quantify the number of jobs they currently have that support their green business activities. The survey results show that the green economy may contribute an additional 12,300 support jobs to Michigan's economy.

## Survey Results: Direct Green Jobs by Core Green Area

As mentioned previously in the report, the primary purpose of the employer survey was to estimate the number of Michigan green jobs, due to the limitations of existing economic databases. Although Michigan industries are assigned codes using the North American Industrial Classification System (NAICS), this

## There are 109,067 Green Jobs in Michigan

## Michigan boasts $\mathbf{1 0 9 , 0 6 7}$ total green jobs-

 both direct and support- among private sector employers. There are 96,767 direct green jobs and 12,300 support green jobs. This is big news, but it also shows the huge potential for growth of the green economy. Michigan's overall private sector employment is 3.2 million; green jobs currently account for 3.4 percent of that total.system has limits in the measurement of green jobs. For example, no single code or group of codes exists to isolate all firms producing components for the manufacture of wind turbines or solar panels.

Therefore, Michigan adapted a green job survey instrument developed by the state of Washington. The Michigan survey asked firms to not only specify occupations that were green-related, but to classify them into the following green "core areas":

- Agriculture and natural resource conservation
- Clean transportation and fuels
- Increasing energy efficiency
- Pollution prevention and environmental cleanup
- Renewable energy production


## Green Jobs Core Areas Definitions

## Agriculture and Natural Resource

Conservation: Natural resource conservation refers to products or services designed to help conserve, maintain, and improve natural resources and the environment. Certain "green" agricultural businesses provide necessary inputs for the production of biomass energy including: wood, agricultural crops and animal wastes. These "crops" can be viewed as renewable and sustainable if managed properly. Other examples include food systems, forest and land management, and organic farming. Sustainable agriculture and forestry are achieved by governmental and private industries adopting certain industry standards utilizing established best management practices.
Clean Transportation and Fuels: Clean transportation refers to the research, development, and production of new technologies for energy storage and alternative fuels, as well as the engineering of improved fuel efficiencies and emissions reductions. Examples of these activities include: advanced batteries, fuel cells, electric and hybrid vehicles, alternative fuels, public transit, and activities related to meeting fuel efficiency standards, and more.

Figure 2: Distribution of Direct Green-Related Jobs by Core Area


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

These categories add significantly more depth to the data, by contrasting the number of green jobs in Michigan in each of these core areas. These core areas illustrate the primary green business activities that generate jobs in the Michigan economy. Figure 2 presents the distribution of green jobs by core area according to the survey results.

As might be expected considering the importance of the auto industry in Michigan, the Clean Transportation and Fuels core area accounts for the largest number of the state's green jobs, roughly 39,300 or 41 percent. Nearly one-quarter of green jobs in the state were attributable to the Energy Efficiency core area, and most of these positions were associated with the state's construction industry.

The remaining third of green jobs was distributed among the other three core areas. Pollution Prevention \& Environmental Cleanup and Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation supplied about 12,000 green jobs each, while Renewable Energy chipped in nearly 9,000 green jobs.

## Green Jobs Core Areas Definitions

## Producing Renewable Energy:

Renewable energy is energy generated from sustainable, natural resourcessuch as sunlight (solar), wind, water (hydro), geothermal heat, and biomass (wood and wood waste, agricultural and energy crops \& associated residues, animal waste, municipal solid waste, food products \& processing waste), that can be naturally regenerated in the short-term. Related businesses include those producing renewable energy as well as firms that produce and supply parts or equipment used in energy collection and distribution such as solar panels or wind turbines.

## Survey Results: Direct Green Jobs by Detailed Industry

Beyond the broader core areas identified by the survey, a key next step was to examine the primary industry sectors in Michigan that generate large
numbers or percentages of green jobs. All Michigan firms are classified by detailed industry using the NAICS coding system, and the survey results were tabulated by 3-digit NAICS industry. Figure 3 presents survey results on the primary industries that generate the largest numbers of Michigan green jobs.

Figure 3: Top Michigan Industries Generating the Largest Number of Direct Green Jobs

| NAICS | Industry | Total Direct Green Jobs | Total Industry Employment | Green Jobs As \% Of Industry Employment |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 336 | Transportation Equipment Manufacturing | 25,780 | 176,254 | 14.6\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, And Technical Services | 22,178 | 241,786 | 9.2\% |
| 238 | Specialty Trade Contractors | 9,825 | 102,467 | 9.6\% |
| 236 | Construction Of Buildings | 3,571 | 34,423 | 10.4\% |
| 111 | Crop Production | 3,503 | 15,942 | 22.0\% |
| 423 | Merchant Wholesalers, Durable Goods | 2,793 | 94,879 | 2.9\% |
| 561 | Administrative Services | 2,698 | 258,314 | 1.0\% |
| 221 | Utilities | 2,608 | 20,518 | 12.7\% |
| 562 | Waste Management And Remediation Services | 2,168 | 11,410 | 19.0\% |
| 332 | Fabricated Metal Manufacturing | 1,995 | 78,488 | 2.5\% |
| 333 | Machinery Manufacturing | 1,664 | 68,848 | 2.4\% |
| 327 | Nonmetallic Mineral Product Manufacturing | 1,448 | 13,276 | 10.9\% |
| 334 | Computer And Electronic Product Manufacturing | 1,304 | 20,848 | 6.3\% |
| 322 | Paper Manufacturing | 1,100 | 13,317 | 8.3\% |
| 325 | Chemical Manufacturing | 1,024 | 27,876 | 3.7\% |
| 321 | Wood Product Manufacturing | 982 | 9,639 | 10.2\% |
| 237 | Heavy And Civil Engineering Construction | 903 | 16,826 | 5.4\% |
| 331 | Primary Metal Manufacturing | 863 | 23,587 | 3.7\% |
| 551 | Management Of Companies And Enterprises | 716 | 55,090 | 1.3\% |
| 811 | Repair And Maintenance | 656 | 36,951 | 1.8\% |
| 113 | Forestry And Logging | 415 | 1,400 | 29.7\% |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

A significant number of Michigan green jobs were generated by the manufacturing and constructionrelated sectors. Of the 21 industries in Figure 3, 13 were engaged in the production of goods, and the majority of those were concentrated in either manufacturing or construction. Michigan's auto sector led the way in the creation of green employment, as Transportation equipment manufacturing supplied about 27,800 jobs to the green economy. However, green jobs were found across a wide range of industries. About one-quarter of the top green job industries were service-based, including three of the top 10 industries. Professional, Scientific and Technical Services ranked second behind auto manufacturing with over 22,000 green jobs, accounting for roughly 23 percent of total Michigan green positions.

Figure 4, highlights the largest industries for each core area. In accordance with the economic makeup of Michigan, detailed industries in the Construction and Manufacturing sectors contribute a significant job share to several core areas. For the most part, green jobs in the core areas were highly concentrated in two or three industry sectors. Employment in Clean Transportation Fuels, the largest core area, was concentrated in two industries: Transportation equipment manufacturing and Professional, scientific, and technical services. These two industry sectors account for 97 percent of total Clean Transportation green jobs. Renewable Energy Production, the smallest core area, had the most dispersed employment. However, its top two industry sectors, Specialty trade contractors and Nonmetallic mineral product manufacturing still accounted for 27 percent of the core's total green employment.

In Figure 4, the Direct Green Jobs by Industry column indicates the total number of green jobs in that industry; the second column shows how many jobs from that industry are in a specific core area, and the third column reveals the percentage of total core area green jobs in a specific industry. Crop production, for instance, has a total of 3,503 green jobs, of which 3,295 are in the core area of Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation. Therefore, the 3,295 core jobs in Crop production account for 27.5 percent of the 11,986 total green jobs in that core area.

As might be expected considering the importance of the auto industry in Michigan, the Clean Transportation and Fuels core area accounts for the largest number of the state's green jobs, roughly 39,300 or 41 percent.


Nearly one-quarter of green jobs-22,236- in the state were attributable to the Energy Efficiency core area, and most of these positions were associated with the state's construction industry.


Renewable Energy Production has nearly 9,000 green jobs.

Figure 4: Large Industries By Core Green Area

| NAICS | Industries within Core Area | Direct Green Jobs By Industry | Direct Green Jobs in Core Area | Percentage of Direct Green Jobs in Core Area |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation (all) |  | 11,986 |  |
| 111 | Crop Production | 3,503 | 3,295 | 27.5\% |
| 561 | Administrative Services | 2,698 | 1,870 | 15.6\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 22,178 | 1,776 | 14.8\% |
| 322 | Paper Manufacturing | 1,100 | 1,000 | 8.3\% |
| 321 | Wood Product Manufacturing | 982 | 223 | 1.9\% |
|  | Clean Transportation and Fuels (all) |  | 39,317 |  |
| 336 | Transportation Equipment Manufacturing | 25,780 | 25,142 | 63.9\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 22,178 | 12,976 | 33.0\% |
|  | Energy Efficiency (all) |  | 22,236 |  |
| 238 | Specialty Trade Contractors | 9,825 | 7,470 | 33.6\% |
| 236 | Construction of Buildings | 3,571 | 2,462 | 11.1\% |
| 221 | Utilities | 2,608 | 2,405 | 10.8\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 22,178 | 2,349 | 10.6\% |
| 423 | Merchant Wholesalers, Durable Goods | 2,793 | 1,436 | 6.5\% |
|  | Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup (all) |  | 12,345 |  |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 22,178 | 4,454 | 36.1\% |
| 562 | Waste Management and Remediation Services | 2,168 | 1,494 | 12.1\% |
| 423 | Merchant Wholesalers, Durable Goods | 2,793 | 932 | 7.5\% |
| 325 | Chemical Manufacturing | 1,024 | 833 | 6.7\% |
| 238 | Specialty Trade Contractors | 9,825 | 806 | 6.5\% |
|  | Renewable Energy Production (all) |  | 8,843 |  |
| 238 | Specialty Trade Contractors | 9,825 | 1,257 | 14.2\% |
| 327 | Nonmetallic Mineral Product Manufacturing | 1,448 | 1,132 | 12.8\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 22,178 | 605 | 6.8\% |
| 562 | Waste Management and Remediation Services | 2,168 | 559 | 6.3\% |
| 321 | Wood Product Manufacturing | 982 | 471 | 5.3\% |

Although, a few industry sectors dominate employment in the individual core areas, some industry sectors are vital to multiple segments of the green economy. For example, the Professional, scientific and technical services industry was prevalent across several core areas, and comprised the largest share (36 percent) of green jobs in Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup. Additionally, the largest number of green jobs in Professional, scientific, and technical services was in the Clean Transportation and Fuels core area, with nearly 13,000 green positions. Another industry sector of note was Specialty trade contractors, which holds a significant share of green employment in three core areas. Specialty trade contractors engage in a wide variety of construction-related activities from site preparation to electrical work. Employment in this sector is highly concentrated in the Energy Efficiency core area with nearly 7,500 jobs or over one-third of the core area's green employment.

## Survey Results: Green Jobs by Detailed Occupation

As mentioned above, survey respondents were asked to specify the detailed occupational titles in their organization that work to provide goods or services in any of the green core areas. These responses were coded by Standard Occupation Code (SOC), and this information is particularly valuable. It provides for the first time actual Michigan survey-based estimates of the types of job titles most prevalent in the green economy, along with employment estimates in those occupations. Figure 5 lists the occupations in Michigan with the largest number of green jobs, according to the survey results.

Engineering occupations reported a significant share of green-related jobs in Michigan, accounting for about 24 percent of Michigan green employment. The largest occupation - Engineers (All Other) - included a variety of reported engineers that could not be specifically classified. Other key greenrelated engineering occupations included Mechanical engineers, Electrical engineers, and Environmental engineers. Engineering occupations can be found in each green core area and in many different industries.

Green Jobs Core Areas Definitions
Increasing Energy Efficiency: Energy
efficiency encompasses all changes that result in a reduction of the energy used for a given energy service (i.e., space heating, lighting, etc.) or level of activity. Examples include: insulation of a building can achieve the same desired temperature with less energy use; adopting green building design/LEED standards encourages downsizing or upgrading of HVAC, lighting and other energy systems, which reduces energy demand in the building; producing an energy efficient household appliance, such as a refrigerator or dryer, which delivers the same performance using less electricity; or providing engineering, consulting or research services on operations, materials, or technologies that improve energy efficiency.

Pollution prevention and environmental cleanup: Pollution prevention refers to products that are designed to have minimal impacts on human health and the environment, and services that eliminate or reduce the amount and toxicity of potentially harmful substances at their source. Businesses that provide services and/or products related to controlling industrial and commercial emissions, environmental remediation, waste treatment, recycling, water conservation and treatment, and brownfield redevelopment are examples in this area.

Production occupations were also common in the green economy. These production occupations represent about 28 percent of all green employment in Michigan. These include job titles such as Assemblers and fabricators (All Other), Production workers (All Other), Machinists, and Power plant operators. While the majority of these occupations are found in the automobile industry, many production
workers find employment in other sectors of the green economy including Renewable Energy Production and Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup.

A variety of green jobs were reported among construction and maintenance occupations. Examples of green construction occupations included Electricians, Carpenters, and Construction Managers, while maintenance occupations included Heating, air

Figure 5: Occupations that Generate the Largest Number of Michigan Direct Green Jobs

| SOC | Occupation | Total Direct Green Jobs | Percent of Total Direct Green Jobs |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Total, All Green Occupations | 96,767 | 100.0\% |
| 17-2199 | Engineers (All Other) | 11,397 | 11.8\% |
| 17-2141 | Mechanical Engineers | 6,809 | 7.0\% |
| 51-2099 | Assemblers and Fabricators, All Other | 3,980 | 4.1\% |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Condition, \& Refrig. Mech \& Installers | 3,444 | 3.6\% |
| 45-2092 | Farmworkers \& Laborers, Crop, Nursery, Greenhouse | 3,303 | 3.4\% |
| 51-9199 | Production Workers, All Other | 3,002 | 3.1\% |
| 37-3011 | Landscaping and Groundskeeping Workers | 2,205 | 2.3\% |
| 49-9042 | General Maintenance and Repair Workers | 1,813 | 1.9\% |
| 47-2111 | Electricians | 1,705 | 1.8\% |
| 17-2071 | Electrical Engineers | 1,555 | 1.6\% |
| 51-4041 | Machinists | 1,541 | 1.6\% |
| 19-2041 | Environmental Scientists \& Specialists | 1,525 | 1.6\% |
| 47-2061 | Construction Laborers | 1,473 | 1.5\% |
| 41-3099 | Sales Representatives, Services, All Other | 1,454 | 1.5\% |
| 51-8013 | Power Plant Operators | 1,215 | 1.3\% |
| 51-1011 | First-Line Supervisors of Production Workers | 1,170 | 1.2\% |
| 51-4031 | Cutting, Punching, and Press Machine Setters, Oper | 1,168 | 1.2\% |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters | 1,161 | 1.2\% |
| 11-9021 | Construction Managers | 1,113 | 1.2\% |
| 51-9061 | Inspectors, Testers, Sorters, Samplers, and Weighers | 1,061 | 1.1\% |
| 51-4111 | Tool and Die Makers | 1,048 | 1.1\% |
| 17-2081 | Environmental Engineers | 988 | 1.0\% |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
conditioning, \& refrigeration mechanics and General maintenance and repair workers. Together, these two broad occupational groups represent about 19 percent of all green jobs in Michigan. Many individuals employed in these job titles are building energy efficient homes, offices, or factories or are retrofitting existing homes, offices, or factories to be more energy efficient.

Green jobs in Michigan are also generated for a variety of professional, technical, and scientific positions. These categories generated over 9,000 green jobs, or nearly 10 percent of the statewide
total. One example of such an occupation in Figure 5 is Environmental scientists \& specialists.

In addition, agriculture-related jobs were also well identified as an important source of green jobs in Michigan. These occupations range from Farmworkers and laborers to Landscaping and groundskeeping workers. Agriculture-related occupations supplied an additional 8 percent of green jobs reported in the survey.

As with industries, occupations can also be ranked within the five core green areas. Figure 6, displays the distribution of green-related positions by core area.


## Figure 6: Top Five Largest Occupations by Core Green Area

| SOC | Occupations Within Core Area | Direct Green Jobs by Occupation | Direct Green Jobs in Core Area | Share of Core Area Direct Green Jobs by Occupation |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation (all) |  | 11,986 |  |
| 45-2092 | Farmworkers and Laborers, Crop, Nursery, and Greenhouse | 3,303 | 3,025 | 25.2\% |
| 37-3011 | Landscaping and Groundskeeping Workers | 2,205 | 1,915 | 16.0\% |
| 51-9199 | Production Workers, All Other | 3,002 | 487 | 4.1\% |
| 17-2081 | Environmental Engineers | 988 | 441 | 3.7\% |
| 19-2041 | Environmental Scientists and Specialists | 1,525 | 412 | 3.4\% |
|  | Clean Transportation and Fuels (all) |  | 39,317 |  |
| 17-2199 | Engineers, All Other | 11,397 | 10,540 | 26.8\% |
| 17-2141 | Mechanical Engineers | 6,809 | 6,119 | 15.6\% |
| 51-2099 | Assemblers/Fabricators, All Other | 3,980 | 3,544 | 9.0\% |
| 51-9199 | Production Workers, All Other | 3,002 | 1,326 | 3.4\% |
| 51-4041 | Machinists | 1,541 | 915 | 2.3\% |
|  | Energy Efficiency (all) |  | 22,236 |  |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers | 3,444 | 2,834 | 12.7\% |
| 49-9042 | Maintenance and Repair Workers, General | 1,813 | 1,271 | 5.7\% |
| 51-8013 | Power Plant Operators | 1,215 | 1,045 | 4.7\% |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters | 1,161 | 985 | 4.4\% |
| 41-3099 | Sales Representatives, Services, All Other | 1,454 | 892 | 4.0\% |
|  | Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup (all) |  | 12,345 |  |
| 19-2041 | Environmental Scientists and Specialists | 1,525 | 884 | 7.2\% |
| 17-2051 | Civil Engineers | 759 | 491 | 4.0\% |
| 19-4091 | Environmental Science and Protection Technicians | 771 | 487 | 3.9\% |
| 53-7081 | Refuse and Recyclable Material Collectors | 595 | 453 | 3.7\% |
| 11-9041 | Engineering Managers | 688 | 424 | 3.4\% |
|  | Renewable Energy Production (all) |  | 8,843 |  |
| 51-9011 | Chemical Equipment Operators and Tenders | 494 | 492 | 5.6\% |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics and Installers | 3,444 | 434 | 4.9\% |
| 47-2111 | Electricians | 1,705 | 222 | 2.5\% |
| 51-4041 | Machinists | 1,541 | 166 | 1.9\% |
|  | Data too few to classify fifth occupation |  |  |  |

Clean Transportation and Fuels- The prevalence of Michigan's automobile industry is very evident from the green job titles in Clean Transportation and Fuels. The five largest occupations in this core area, accounting for nearly 60 percent of green jobs, represent a diverse range of educational requirements and skill sets. On the high end, Engineers require significant investments in education and training. Moderate-skill occupations such as Assemblers and fabricators and Production workers require less education, although do require moderate-term to long-term on-the-job training. Despite the declining recent trend in jobs in the Michigan auto industry, it is likely that the share of jobs in the industry that will be involved with the research, engineering, and production of fuel-efficient and alternative fuel vehicles will continue to grow.

Energy Efficiency- The majority of occupations in the Energy Efficiency core area are constructionrelated. Occupations such as Heating, air conditioning, \& refrigeration installers, Carpenters, and General maintenance and repair workers are commonly needed in new building construction or retrofitting projects. Although not appearing in the top five job titles in Figure 6, many managerial and supervisory jobs are created in the Energy Efficiency core area due to the need to meet green-building quality standards.

Agriculture and Natural Resource ConservationMichigan has a very significant agricultural sector and vast natural resources. Accordingly, many jobs in the Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation core area can be found on Michigan farms and in Michigan's national, state, and local parks. Occupations such as Crop, nursery, and greenhouse workers reflect the many jobs supplied by Michigan's organic and sustainable agriculture segment. In contrast, a portion of jobs in occupations such as Landscaping and groundskeeping workers were identified in the survey as green, and make up a significant share of jobs in this core area. Environmental engineers contribute skilled green jobs in the area of Natural Resource Conservation.

## Pollution Prevention and Environmental

Cleanup-Occupations in Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup range from the workers

## Which critical occupations are Michigan focus group employers finding hard to fill NOW?

$\checkmark$ Energy Auditors - HERS Raters (Home Energy Rating System)
$\checkmark$ Skilled Trades (All)
$\checkmark$ Lead/Hazardous Materials Workers
$\checkmark$ Accountants
$\checkmark$ Wind Technicians
$\checkmark$ Agri-Tourism Specialists
$\checkmark$ Food Safety Specialists
$\checkmark$ Aquaculturalists
$\checkmark$ Urban Farmers
$\checkmark$ Truckers
$\checkmark$ PV Installers
$\checkmark$ Heavy Equipment Operators
$\checkmark$ AC/DC Electrical Workers
$\checkmark$ HVAC (install and adapt for bio-mass systems)
$\checkmark$ Plumbers
$\checkmark$ Designers for PV, Wind, Solar applications
$\checkmark$ Sales People with knowledge in green
$\checkmark$ Semi-Conductor Engineers
$\checkmark$ Vacuum Techs
$\checkmark$ Purchasing/Procure-ment/Product Developers
$\checkmark$ Qualified Tool Makers
$\checkmark$ Management that can take advantage of government funding opportunities, understand new regulations impacted by new technologies

Source: Focus Groups with Michigan Employers, February - March, 2009
who operate recycling trucks to the scientists and engineers who research and develop pollution control equipment. About 22 percent of green occupations in this core area were generated in five job titles, including Environmental scientists \& specialists, Civil engineers, Environmental science \& protection technicians, Refuse \& material collectors, and Engineering managers.

Renewable Energy Production-The most diverse set of occupations can be found in Michigan's Renewable Energy production core area. A wide range of occupations contribute green jobs to this core area, such as engineers, technicians, mechanics and installers, and production staff. Jobs range from technical and professional jobs generated by alternative energy research, to skilled manufacturing positions involved with the production of products or parts for the alternative energy supply chain, to jobs for agricultural workers engaged in the production of agricultural inputs used in renewable energy.

## Survey Results: Employer Expectations

Expectations of employers regarding current and future green-related workforce needs are a critical element in further understanding green jobs. Accordingly, the Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth asked employers in this survey questions regarding: (1) expected future job gains in green occupations, (2) expected difficulty filling future green job vacancies (3) whether occupations require unique skills when working on green projects (4) and the potential use of formal versus informal training for existing and new green workers.

## Hiring

Employers were asked to estimate for each current green occupation their expectation for employment in 2011. (Responses to this survey question were received from only a share of survey respondents). Figure 7 displays the specific occupations which an above-average share of employers anticipate


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
additional jobs in the next two years. This information does not represent actual employment forecasts, but does provide clues of occupations with some potential for future short-term employment gains.

These growth occupations represent a broad range of skill levels. There are mid to lower skilled occupations that require primarily on-the-job training, such as heating, air conditioning, and refrigeration mechanics and installers, construction laborers, and landscaping and groundskeeping workers. Many other job titles with solid employment expectations are high skill occupations, such as engineering, management, and technical specialist positions. These often require a four-year degree and several years of relevant work experience. Future green jobs will demand various levels of skills and training.

## Filling Vacancies

Employers indicated on the survey the green occupations in which they anticipate difficulty in filling future job vacancies. While differences exist among industries, it is possible to identify specific
occupations that employers believe will be especially hard-to-fill (see Figure 8 below). For the most part, occupations that require specialized skills, education, and experience will face the most difficulties.
Engineers were heavily represented in this list. Sales, management, and construction trade job openings were also mentioned as potentially hard-to-fill.

## Unique Skills

Employers were also asked to identify occupations that require unique skills when working on a "green project." As Figure 9 below indicates, there were ten occupations that roughly 50-80 percent of responding employers highlighted as requiring unique skills for "green" projects. This has implications for training providers, as individual green occupations will differ in their need for specialized training. Some occupations will require very skilled workers, but the skill sets used by those workers on a "green" project will be very similar to the skills they will utilize when working on a "non-green" project. Occupations that utilize unique skills when applied to "green" projects

Figure 8: Which Green Occupations do Employers Anticipate Potential Recruiting Difficulties?


Figure 9: Occupations that Require Unique Skills for "Green Projects"


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
are those that may need more specialized training. This has implications for incumbent workers who increasingly find themselves working on "green" projects, as well as potential new green workers hoping to transition from existing industries into the green economy.

Figure 9 lists the ten leading occupations that employers identify as needing unique skills when working on "green" projects. It appears that occupations that require significant levels of education or training are more likely to require specialized skills. Six of the leading occupations identified as requiring unique skills were professional or managerial positions.

Figure 10: Anticipated Training Demand: Formal vs. Informal Training


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor, and Economic Growth

## Training

In an attempt to measure the training needs of employers, the survey asked employers about the likely mix of training for their green-related workforce between:

- Formal training provided by community colleges or other training providers
- Informal training of staff on-the-job

The question sheds some light on the potential future green-related training capacity requirements in the state.

As Figure 10 illustrates, survey respondents indicated that roughly 68 percent of their future employee training needs may be conducted on-the-job. Although only about 32 percent of training needs may be formal, most of the individual industry sectors did report some expected utilization of formal training.

The information in this section would not have been possible without the participation of over 6,400 employers who took the time to respond to the Michigan Green Jobs Survey. This effort has given us the first set of survey-based estimates ever produced on Michigan's current levels of green jobs by detailed industry and occupation. However, the survey asked a limited number of questions and could not address some critical variables regarding the green workforce, such as recent employment trends, more details on industries and occupations, and key topics such as the wages, skills, and educational requirements for specific green-related jobs.

To address those issues, the remaining chapters in this report will supplement the information from the employer survey by incorporating existing sources of labor market information. The use of multiple information sources will provide the most comprehensive understanding of green jobs in Michigan.

## What training issues need to be resolved for Michigan employers?

"Old school methods for drawing and drafting need to be brought back. A lot of talent never develops because using computers prevents from some foundational skills from being developed."
"Auto people are highly specialized but need to be cross trained in order to build an entire machine, not just a component."
"Unions are still catching up to the new tech products. Training needs to get accelerated and inspectors need to learn along with the electricians."
"Training for 'green’ needs to start in high school. We need to re-emphasize shop and vocational classes in high schools."
"It is important to go "Back-to-Basics" - STEM skills, electrical, mechanical skills, etc.. Fifty percent (50\%) of persons applying to apprenticeships are rejected because they don't meet the basic requirements of a GED/high school degree and sufficient algebra completion."

Source: Focus Groups with Michigan Employers, February - March, 2009

## Chapter II: Green-Related Industries in the Michigan Economy


#### Abstract

The information from the survey on green jobs is critical because it represents the first attempt to collect data directly from employers on the number of current green jobs in the Michigan economy. However, employer surveys need to be concise and focused to reduce reporting burden, so a number of additional issues regarding green jobs were not addressed in the survey questionnaire.


These additional issues include

## Industry Information

$\checkmark$ Is there a way to shed light on recent employment trends among firms in the green economy or among industries that appear related to the green economy?
$\checkmark$ Which broad green-related industry clusters provide the most total jobs, display competitive employment performance, or may have been more stable recently in terms of job trends?
$\checkmark$ Which green-related industry sectors pay aboveaverage wages?

## Occupational Information

$\checkmark$ Can a set of green-related occupations be identified? If so, what are the basic characteristics of these jobs?
$\checkmark$ Which green-related occupations are large enough in Michigan to produce multiple annual job openings?
$\checkmark$ What are examples of high-wage green-related occupations?
$\checkmark$ Are there green-related job titles available in the Michigan economy for persons with differing educational/training backgrounds? Do career ladders exist in the green economy?
$\checkmark$ What are some of the key skills and knowledge sets needed in certain green-related occupations?

The following section contains information on "green-related industries." These are industries identified by our research staff as sectors most likely to provide green jobs. The purpose of the section is to highlight the economic characteristics of these industries such as wage levels, employment trends, employment concentration, and competitive employment performance. The remaining chapters on green-related firms and
 occupations will round out the report by providing additional complementary information not obtained from the employer survey.

To understand the following section on "greenrelated industries", it is important to define this term and distinguish it from the green jobs estimates generated by the employer survey.

## Green-related Industry Analysis Understanding the Data

There are several advantages gained by examining the green economy through industry employment data. The Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) program provides a wealth of information
on detailed industries including the number of firms, employment levels and trends, and wages. For this report, the primary advantage of the QCEW data is that it can provide these variables for detailed industries related to the green economy.

A few caveats should be mentioned before attempting to examine industry information. In the section that follows, the term "green-related industry" will be used extensively. It is defined as follows:

## Green-Related Industry-

A detailed industry sector that is likely to contain firms that produce parts, components, products or services related to the green economy. The green economy includes activities such as renewable energy, energy efficiency, clean transportation and fuels, agriculture and natural resources, and pollution prevention and environmental cleanup.

However, the identification of these green-related industries was not easy or straightforward. This is primarily because the NAICS classification system is not specific enough to identify specific green sectors. There is no single NAICS code or set of codes to capture all firms involved in wind energy, solar energy, or research into alternative fuels.

As a result, many of the green-related industries we selected for this chapter of the study are only partially "green". However, analyzing this set of green-related industries is important, because these are the some of the industry sectors that could benefit most from an expansion of the Michigan green economy. The results of our initial employer survey and future surveys will help us to eventually refine this list to identify the share of jobs in each greenrelated industry that is truly "green".

What this also means is the employment trends in these green-related sectors must be evaluated with caution. Since many are only partially related to green activities, the employment trends displayed are impacted by many factors beyond the green economy.

For example, while the construction industry holds a good number of jobs related to energy efficiency (a green core area), the recent national recession and housing market crash has adversely affected all employment in that sector. The same is true of the automobile industry. Even though engineers in the auto industry are increasingly focused on technology development to improve the fuel efficiency of vehicles, the enormous job cuts in the overall Michigan auto sector will obscure any job gains among green workers in the industry.

Our research staff used multiple resources to compile a list of green-related industries (please see the Appendix for a complete list of these sectors).

- A literature review was conducted of available studies on the topic of industries and the green economy. Each research report was examined for specific industry titles mentioned as being "green-related".
- Michigan worked closely with a consortium of labor market research organizations in several other states on the topic of defining industries and occupations related to the green economy. Green-related industry job listings compiled by the states of Washington and Pennsylvania were reviewed.
- Specific Michigan firms related to the green economy were identified, and a sample of these firms was reviewed to identify their industry codes.
- Michigan research staff conducted a comprehensive review of the NAICS coding system for industries that appeared to be "green-related".
- The list of green-related industries was vetted by a team of state government and private industry representatives.


## Employment in Michigan's Green Clusters

The set of green-related detailed industries identified in this report account for over one in ten of Michigan's total private jobs. These detailed industries were classified into seven broad clusters for this analysis. These include five clusters common with the core areas in the green employer survey,
and two additional categories, Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing and Engineering, Testing, and Consulting Services. The seven clusters are:

- Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation
- Clean Transportations and Fuels
- Engineering, Testing, and Consulting Services
- Increasing Energy Efficiency
- Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing
- Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup
- Renewable Energy Production

The Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing cluster includes manufacturing industry sectors that do not solely focus on one area of the green economy. A prime example would be firms in the business of Measuring and controlling device manufacturing. This industry is engaged in the production of controlling and measuring devices that have a wide range of applications - from measuring output of renewable energy plants to monitoring factories with the goal of preventing pollution. There were several manufacturing industries similar to this example involved in various aspects of the green economy, so the creation of a separate green manufacturing cluster was essential.

The Professional, scientific, and technical services industry provided a similar challenge. It is highly likely that firms in this broad industry provide services in a wide array of green-related activities; and the sector as a whole does not neatly fit in any of the original clusters. Therefore, the research team developed the Engineering, Testing, and Consulting Services cluster, which contains many industries that provide professional services across the green economy.

In total, 118 green-related industries were identified and assigned to a specific green cluster based on each detailed industry's associated activities, products, and services. Figure 11 displays the top five industries with the highest employment for each of the green-related segments.

Increasing Energy Efficiency was the largest green cluster, accounting for about 118,000 jobs, or 31 percent of total employment in Michigan's greenrelated industries. This industry segment is highly
concentrated in construction, which accounts for nearly 77 percent of employment. It is appropriate that the construction industry comprises the majority of the Increasing Energy Efficiency cluster, since current actions in energy efficiency, to a large extent, deal with updating building structures.

Clean Transportation and Fuels stands as the second largest core cluster in terms of employment, accounting for 28 percent of total green-related employment or 109,000 jobs overall. The Clean Transportation and Fuels segment is comprised of detailed industries primarily in auto manufacturing and mass transit. Michigan's concentration of auto jobs dominates this cluster, and manufacturing industries overall account for 97 percent of cluster jobs.

Engineering, Testing, and Consulting Services was the third largest green cluster, comprising 22.1 percent of total green-related employment and employing over 85,000 workers. All the industry sectors within this green segment reside in the Professional, scientific, and technical services sector, which provides specialized expertise, such as research and legal advice, to a variety of private and public clients.

Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup ranked fourth in jobs among the green core segments, accounting for six percent of total greenrelated employment. However, nearly half of total employment in this cluster was concentrated in Waste Management and Remediation Services, which deals with the collection, disposal, and treatment of waste materials.

Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing provided over 19,000 jobs, or nearly five percent of total green-related employment in Michigan. This category includes manufacturing industries engaged in producing a diverse set of products, ranging from wood to organic chemicals.

Renewable Energy Production provided over 18,000 jobs, or just 4.7 percent of green-related employment. Detailed industries in Utilities and Manufacturing, focused in the areas of electricity generation and distribution, comprised the majority of the Renewable Energy Production cluster, accounting for about 60 percent of employment.

Figure 11: Employment in Select Green-Related Industries/Clusters, Michigan 2008 Q2

| NAICS | Cluster / Industry | 2008 Q2 <br> Employment | Share of Cluster | Share of Total GreenRelated Employment |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency |  | 117,828 |  | 30.6\% |
| 238212 | Electrical Contractors and Other Wiring Installation Contractors <br> - Nonresidential | 16,306 | 13.8\% | 4.2\% |
| 238222 | Plumbing, Heating, and Air-Conditioning Contractors - Nonresidential | 13,719 | 11.6\% | 3.6\% |
| 236220 | Commercial and Institutional Building Construction | 13,362 | 11.3\% | 3.5\% |
| 238221 | Plumbing, Heating, and Air-Conditioning Contractors - Residential | 9,690 | 8.2\% | 2.5\% |
| 236118 | Residential Remodelers | 8,462 | 7.2\% | 2.2\% |
| Clean Transportation and Fuels |  | 109,044 |  | 28.3\% |
| 336111 | Automobile Manufacturing | 40,875 | 37.5\% | 10.6\% |
| 336399 | All Other Motor Vehicle Parts Manufacturing | 21,494 | 19.7\% | 5.6\% |
| 336350 | Motor Vehicle Transmission and Power Train Parts Manufacturing | 15,371 | 14.1\% | 4.0\% |
| 336360 | Motor Vehicle Seating and Interior Trim Manufacturing | 12,367 | 11.3\% | 3.2\% |
| 336312 | Gasoline Engine and Engine Parts Manufacturing | 10,543 | 9.7\% | 2.7\% |
| Engineering, Testing, and Consulting Services |  | 85,293 |  | 22.1\% |
| 541330 | Engineering Services | 38,734 | 45.4\% | 10.1\% |
| 541380 | Testing Laboratories | 19,869 | 23.3\% | 5.2\% |
| 541712 | R \& D in the Physical, Engineering, and Life Science (except biotech) | 16,409 | 19.2\% | 4.3\% |
| 541614 | Process, Physical Distribution, and Logistics Consulting Services | 4,029 | 4.7\% | 1.0\% |
| 541620 | Environmental Consulting Services | 1,893 | 2.2\% | 0.5\% |
| Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup |  | 22,994 |  | 6.0\% |
| 562111 | Solid Waste Collection | 4,374 | 19.0\% | 1.1\% |
| 423930 | Recyclable Material Merchant Wholesalers | 4,364 | 19.0\% | 1.1\% |
| 237110 | Water and Sewer Line and Related Structures Construction | 3,494 | 15.2\% | 0.9\% |
| 238911 | Site Preparation Contractors | 3,326 | 14.5\% | 0.9\% |
| 562910 | Remediation Services | 2,059 | 9.0\% | 0.5\% |
| Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing |  | 19,033 |  | 4.9\% |
| 325211 | Plastics Material and Resin Manufacturing | 6,651 | 34.9\% | 1.7\% |
| 322121 | Paper (except Newsprint) Mills | 2,463 | 12.9\% | 0.6\% |
| 334513 | Instruments Manufacturing for Measuring \& Controlling Industrial Process Variables | 1,999 | 10.5\% | 0.5\% |
| 321920 | Wood Container and Pallet Manufacturing | 1,619 | 8.5\% | 0.4\% |
| 334419 | Other Electronic Component Manufacturing | 1,245 | 6.5\% | 0.3\% |
| Renewable Energy Production |  | 18,139 |  | 4.7\% |
| 237130 | Power and Communication Line and Related Structures Construction | 4,311 | 23.8\% | 1.1\% |
| 221210 | Natural Gas Distribution | 3,117 | 17.2\% | 0.8\% |
| 321113 | Sawmills | 2,021 | 11.1\% | 0.5\% |
| 221122 | Electric Power Distribution | 1,554 | 8.6\% | 0.4\% |
| 113310 | Logging | 1,313 | 7.2\% | 0.3\% |

Continued next page

From previous page
Figure 11: Employment in Select Green-Related Industries/Clusters, Michigan 2008 Q2

| NAICS | Cluster / Industry | 2008 Q2 <br> Employment | Share <br> of <br> Cluster | Share of <br> Total Green- <br> Related <br> Employment |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | :---: | :---: |
| Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation | 13,024 |  | $3.4 \%$ |  |
| 111422 | Floriculture Production | 4,900 | $37.6 \%$ | $1.3 \%$ |
| 111421 | Nursery and Tree Production | 4,504 | $34.6 \%$ | $1.2 \%$ |
| 813312 | Environment, Conservation and Wildlife Organizations | 1,264 | $9.7 \%$ | $0.3 \%$ |
| 111998 | All Other Miscellaneous Crop Farming | 602 | $4.6 \%$ | $0.2 \%$ |
| 712190 | Nature Parks and Other Similar Institutions | 524 | $4.0 \%$ | $0.1 \%$ |
| Total Green Related Employment | 385,355 |  |  |  |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation was the smallest green segment, with only 3.4 percent (13,000 employees) of total green-related jobs. (It is important to note that the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages program (QCEW), that generates this employment data, does not capture selfemployed workers, which is a significant component in agriculture). Two industries in this green segment stood out: Floriculture production and Nursery tree production comprised 72.2 percent of total employment in the cluster. Many of the industry sectors in this area are engaged in crop production, which is very sensitive to seasonal variations.

Figure 12: Share of Green-Related Employment by Cluster, Michigan 2008 Q2


## Broad Cluster Analysis Location Quotients

An analysis of green-related industries in Michigan can be put into perspective by comparing statewide results to national norms. By deriving location quotients for each of Michigan's seven green-related industry clusters, it is possible to compare base employment and industrial activity across regions. A state's location quotient is determined by comparing the share of employment in a particular industry or cluster to the share of employment in that same industry in the national economy. A location quotient greater than 1.0 for a detailed industry signals that an area has a concentration of jobs above the national average in that industry. Four out of Michigan's seven broad green-related clusters have location quotients
greater than 1.0 (Figure 13). Each of the four clusters witnessed losses in employment from 2004 to 2008. The only broad cluster to gain in employment over that time, Renewable Energy Production, had a relatively low concentration of employment in Michigan.

Many green-related industries suffered job loss from 2004 to 2008, as did the broader Michigan economy. However, a handful of detailed greenrelated sectors in Michigan are not only relatively highly concentrated in terms of jobs, but also managed to record employment growth from 2004 to 2008. Process \& logistics consulting firms, which offer operating advice and assistance in areas such as manufacturing operations improvement, productivity, production planning, and quality assurance, were 44 percent more concentrated in Michigan than in


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
the United States in the second quarter of 2008. Employment in this industry was up nearly four percent since 2004. Firms in the business of Industrial design services have also recorded employment expansion since 2004, and are highly concentrated in the Michigan economy (Figure 14). Taken as a whole, the green-related industries selected for this study comprise a higher share of total jobs in Michigan than is true of the national economy.

As was previously mentioned, it should be noted that not all jobs in these green-related sectors are currently generated by the green economy. However, if green business expands in the state, many existing Michigan firms in these sectors could have the expertise to diversify into green business activities.

## Job Change in Green-Related Industries

In recent years, Michigan's economy has been impacted by significant levels of job loss. Between the second quarter of 2004 and 2008, private payroll jobs in Michigan experienced a decline of 5.4 percent. Following the state's trend, total jobs in this set of green-related industries jobs also contracted during this time, falling at a faster rate of 18.5 percent. However, this is an imperfect gauge of the status of green-related employment, since many of the job cuts in these industries had nothing to do with the green economy, but merely reflect that many green-related jobs are in the manufacturing and construction industry sectors. These are the very sectors most impacted by recent job loss, due to the deterioration of the auto industry and the collapse of the housing market.

Despite these data limitations, Figure 15 displays some relevant results. This chart contrasts the percentage point change in employment for all seven green-related clusters, from 2004 to 2008. Despite the recent decline of total jobs in green-related industries, three of the clusters have outperformed the change in total state payroll jobs. The Agriculture and Natural Resource and the Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing segments declined more slowly than total jobs, at -2.1 percent and -5.1 percent, respectively.

A relative bright spot is Renewable Energy Production, which showed a growth rate of 7.1 percent during this period of economic slowdown. The bulk of this growth is fueled by two industries, Power and


## Renewable Energy-

The Renewable Energy Production cluster showed a growth rate of 7.1 percent during this period of economic slowdown.

communication line and related structures construction (+996 jobs) and Semiconductor and related device manufacturing (+835 jobs). Establishments that produce solar and fuel cells may be classified in the Semiconductor and related device manufacturing industry.

The majority of the job losses stemmed from two core areas: Clean Transportation and Fuels, and Increasing Energy Efficiency. Not surprisingly, there is a high concentration of manufacturing and construction sectors in these two clusters.

About one-third of the total green-related industries exhibited job gains over this period. Figure 16 shows a selection of specific green-related industries that exhibited gains in employment between the $2^{\text {nd }}$ quarter of 2004 and 2008, with the Renewable Energy Production industries mentioned above leading the growth. A diverse set of greenrelated industry sectors displayed job growth, from Recyclable material merchant wholesalers - which deals with the distribution of industrial scrap and other recyclable materials - to firms involve in providing Environmental consulting services. The growth of the green economy spans an array of industry sectors.

Figure 14: Cluster and Select Industry Employment, Location Quotient, Employment Change; Michigan, 2004-2008

| Cluster / Industry |  | Location Quotient | 2008 Q2 Emp | '04-'08 Emp Change |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Agriculture \& Natural Resource Conservation |  | 1.28 | 13,024 | -2.2\% |
| 111422 | Floriculture Production | 2.72 | 4,900 | 0.3\% |
| 712190 | Nature Parks | 2.04 | 524 | 8.5\% |
| Clean Transportation \& Fuels |  | 5.45 | 109,044 | -33.6\% |
| Engineering, Testing, \& Consulting |  | 1.38 | 85,293 | -6.4\% |
| 541330 | Engineering Services | 1.36 | 38,734 | -1.4\% |
| 541380 | Testing Laboratories | 4.36 | 19,869 | -11.7\% |
| 541614 | Process \& Logistics Consulting | 1.44 | 4,029 | 3.8\% |
| 541712 | R\&D in the Physical, Eng., Life Sciences | 1.29 | 16,409 | -10.4\% |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency |  | 0.77 | 117,828 | -17.2\% |
| 327215 | Glass Product Manufacturing | 3.45 | 5,061 | -15.1\% |
| 327993 | Automatic Environmental Control Mfg. | 1.42 | 998 | -5.5\% |
| 541420 | Industrial Design Services | 4.91 | 2,039 | 53.7\% |
| Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing |  | 1.03 | 19,033 | -5.1\% |
| 325211 | Plastics Material \& Resin Mfg. | 3.64 | 6,651 | -0.5\% |
| 325311 | Measuring and Controlling Devices | 1.14 | 1,114 | -5.6\% |
| Pollution Prevention \& Environmental Cleanup |  | 0.94 | 22,994 | -8.0\% |
| 221320 | Sewage Treatment Facilities | 1.54 | 357 | -1.4\% |
| 423930 | Recyclable Materials Merchant Wholesalers | 1.21 | 4,364 | 10.1\% |
| 562111 | Solid Waste Collection | 1.20 | 4,374 | 9.8\% |
| 562112 | Hazardous Waste Collection | 2.76 | 650 | -14.2\% |
| 562219 | Other Non-hazardous Waste Treat. \& Disp. | 3.11 | 1,462 | 2.8\% |
| 562998 | All Other Misc. Waste Management Services | 1.19 | 479 | -10.3\% |
| Renewable Energy Production |  | 0.57 | 18,139 | 7.1\% |
| 221119 | Other Electric Power Generation | 1.04 | 314 | -9.5\% |
| 486210 | Pipeline Transportation of Natural Gas | 1.16 | 909 | -9.0\% |
| All Green-Related Clusters |  | 1.21 | 385,355 | -18.5\% |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Figure 15: Change in Employment for Green-Related Clusters, Michigan 2004 to 2008


## Michigan's Competitive Employment Performance in Green-related Industries

A few green-related industries have grown more rapidly in Michigan than in the United States. To better understand this, we take up a measure of Competitive Employment Performance. This variable measures the level of local job growth in an industry which is above the increase that would have been realized had that local industry simply matched the national industry trend. Competitive Employment Performance sectors include statewide industries that are adding jobs faster in Michigan than nationally, and may indicate that an industry sector enjoys a regional competitive advantage. Figure 17 identifies a few green-related sectors in which job gains in Michigan have outpaced national trends.

Areas of relative strength for Michigan's green-related industries were concentrated in the Increasing Energy Efficiency, Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing, and Renewable Energy Production clusters. The single best Competitive Employment Performance industry in Michigan included firms in the business of producing Semiconductor and related devices. From the second quarter of 2004 to the same quarter in 2008, this industry added 835 jobs in Michigan. During the same period, the industry nationally shed an estimated 11,500 jobs. It is likely that Michigan's comparatively good performance reflects growth of employment in solar manufacturing whereas the larger national reduction of jobs reflects primarily non-green production cutbacks, such as chips for computers.

Figure 16: Employment Growth in Michigan’s Green Related Industries, 2004-2008

| NAICS | NAICS Title | $\mathbf{2 0 0 4}$ <br> $\mathbf{Q 2}$ | $\mathbf{2 0 0 8}$ <br> Q2 | \# <br> Change | \% <br> Change |
| :--- | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 237130 | Power and Communication Line and Related Structures <br> Construction | 3,315 | 4,311 | 996 | 30.0 |
| 334413 | Semiconductor and Related Device Manufacturing | 325 | 1,160 | 835 | 256.9 |
| 541420 | Industrial Design Services | 1,327 | 2,039 | 712 | 53.7 |
| 423930 | Recyclable Material Merchant Wholesalers | 3,962 | 4,364 | 402 | 10.1 |
| 813312 | Environment, Conservation and Wildlife Organizations | 904 | 1,264 | 360 | 39.8 |
| 334419 | Other Electronic Component Manufacturing | 958 | 1,245 | 287 | 30.0 |
| 541620 | Environmental Consulting Services | 1,732 | 1,893 | 161 | 9.3 |
| 541690 | Other Scientific and Technical Consulting Services | 884 | 1,013 | 129 | 14.6 |
| 335122 | Commercial, Industrial, and Institutional Electric Lighting <br> Fixture Manufacturing | 284 | 353 | 69 | 24.3 |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Figure 17: Job Change and Competitive Employment Performance for Green Clusters and Select Industries; Michigan, 2004-2008

| Cluster / Industry | Jobs <br> $\mathbf{2 0 0 4}$ | Jobs <br> $\mathbf{2 0 0 8}$ <br> Change <br> in Jobs | MI <br> Percent <br> Change | U.S. <br> Percent <br> Change |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency | 1,327 | 2,039 | 712 | $53.7 \%$ | $37.4 \%$ |  |
| 541420 | Industrial Design Services | 2,235 | 2,539 | 304 | $13.6 \%$ | $-1.8 \%$ |
| 333415 | Air-Conditioning, Heat, Refrigeration Equip. |  |  |  |  |  |
| Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 334419 | Other Electronic Component Manufacturing | 958 | 1,245 | 287 | $30.0 \%$ | $9.4 \%$ |
| 326113 | Unlaminated Plastics Film \& Sheet | 642 | 751 | 109 | $17.0 \%$ | $-10.8 \%$ |
| Pollution Prevention \& Environmental Cleanup |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 562920 | Materials Recovery Facilities | 133 | 74 | $125.4 \%$ | $34.4 \%$ |  |
| Renewable Energy Production |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 237130 | Power \& Communication Line Construction | 3,315 | 4,311 | 996 | $30.0 \%$ | $24.9 \%$ |
| 334413 | Semiconductor and Related Devices | 325 | 1,160 | 835 | $256.9 \%$ | $-5.2 \%$ |

[^2]
## Wages in Green-related Industry Clusters

The total impact of green-related industries is not limited to their direct employment numbers. Wages paid across specific industries provide a good deal of information about prospects for growth and offers clues about what kind of potential total impact a particular industry has on the economy in terms of disposable income and spending. If a particular industry pays above-average wages, it is important to recognize the impact that industry has on the local economy, well beyond the direct jobs supplied.

The table below presents average industry wages for Michigan green-related industries from the Quarterly Census of Employment \& Wages (QCEW) program. This data reflects overtime pay and bonuses, and reflects the wages earned by all workers in these industries, not just green-related workers. Each of these sectors obviously employs a mix of occupations, earning high, moderate, and low earnings level. However, despite these data limitations, the wage data for industries likely to employ green workers shows that many pay above average wage levels.

The table below offers a broad view of the seven green-related industry clusters identified earlier in the report, and provides some general insight into the potential relative wage impacts of segments of the green economy.

As Figure 18 illustrates, the wage impact of this set of green-related industries is much higher on average than those industries not associated with the green economy. As of the second quarter 2008, the Engineering, Testing and Consulting Services cluster paid the highest wages per worker on an annualized basis. Workers across a variety of occupations within these industries made roughly $\$ 81,900$ per year on average, nearly double the overall private average of $\$ 42,200$. This is not surprising considering that many businesses within this group employ workers with extensive technical and scientific knowledge in industries such as Testing laboratories, Research and development, and Engineering and environmental consulting.

In fact, aside from Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation, all green-related industry groups provide above-average industry wage rates. Clean Transportation and Fuels was a very close second with wages almost 90 percent higher than average, due to payroll generated by the Michigan auto industry. And, despite the high average wages displayed by the top two clusters, Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup, which ranked second to last, averaged a 12.5 percent premium over total private wages per worker.

Figure 18: Total Payrolls and Per-Worker Averages in Green-related Clusters

| Cluster Description | Total Wages <br> (Annualized) | Per Worker <br> Wages <br> (Annualized) | Comparison with <br> Private Sector <br> Average Wage |
| :--- | ---: | :---: | :---: |
| Engineering, Testing and Consulting Services | $\$ 6,984,542,112$ | $\$ 81,889$ | $+\$ 39,722$ |
| Clean Transportation and Fuels | $\$ 8,644,817,928$ | $\$ 79,278$ | $+\$ 37,112$ |
| Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing | $\$ 1,157,841,632$ | $\$ 60,833$ | $+\$ 18,667$ |
| Renewable Energy Production | $\$ 1,022,781,804$ | $\$ 56,386$ | $+\$ 14,219$ |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency | $\$ 5,927,686,336$ | $\$ 50,308$ | $+\$ 8,141$ |
| Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup | $\$ 1,091,248,976$ | $\$ 47,458$ | $+\$ 5,291$ |
| Agriculture and Natural Resource Conservation | $\$ 307,752,536$ | $\$ 23,630$ | $-\$ 18,537$ |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Michigan Green Jobs Report 2009

## Wages in Detailed Green and Green-related Industries

The wages in the broad clusters serve to provide a general overview of green-related industry wages. However, more detailed information on specific green and green-related industries can be gleaned from the QCEW data as well. The table below provides a look at the top 15 three-digit NAICS industries ranked in terms of their share of overall green jobs (according to the results from the survey) and the average weekly wages (from the QCEW) paid in each industry overall (not just to green workers).

As Figure 19 indicates, green-related industries hold the potential for workers to earn positive wage rates. Thirteen of the top 15 broad industries in
terms of green jobs paid more than the private sector average weekly wage of $\$ 811$, while ten were well above this average (at least $\$ 100$ per week more). Furthermore, eight of the top 15 green industries paid more than $\$ 1,000$ per week, or over $\$ 50,000$ per year.

The highest paying of the industries that generate many green jobs was Utilities, which averaged roughly $\$ 1,480$ per week per worker in the second quarter 2008. Close behind it were the Transportation equipment manufacturing (\$1,421), Professional and technical services $(\$ 1,341)$, and Chemical manufacturing (\$1,335) industries.

Though manufacturing industries account for many of the highest-paying green-related sectors, opportunities to make decent wages in the green

Figure 19: Average Weekly Wages per Worker in Top Green Job Industries*

| 3-digit NAICS | Industry Name | Average Industry <br> Weekly Wages | Share of Total <br> Green Jobs |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 336 | Transportation Equipment Manufacturing | $\$ 1,421$ | $26.6 \%$ |
| 541 | Professional and Technical Services | $\$ 1,341$ | $22.9 \%$ |
| 238 | Specialty Trade Contractors | $\$ 885$ | $10.2 \%$ |
| 236 | Construction of Buildings | $\$ 873$ | $3.7 \%$ |
| 111 | Crop Production | $\$ 414$ | $3.6 \%$ |
| 423 | Merchant Wholesalers, Durable Goods | $\$ 1,202$ | $2.9 \%$ |
| 561 | Administrative Services | $\$ 568$ | $2.8 \%$ |
| 221 | Utilities | $\$ 1,480$ | $2.7 \%$ |
| 562 | Waste Management and Remediation Services | $\$ 922$ | $2.2 \%$ |
| 332 | Fabricated Metal Product Manufacturing | $\$ 888$ | $2.1 \%$ |
| 333 | Machinery Manufacturing | $\$ 1,095$ | $1.7 \%$ |
| 327 | Nonmetallic Mineral Product Manufacturing | $\$ 1,059$ | $1.5 \%$ |
| 334 | Computer and Electronic Product Manu. | $\$ 1,066$ | $\$ 969$ |
| 322 | Paper Manufacturing | $\$ 1,335$ | $\$ 811$ |
| 325 | Chemical Manufacturing | $1.3 \%$ |  |
|  | Average Industry Weekly Wage | $1.1 \%$ |  |

*Share of total green jobs derived from DELEG employer survey. Average wages come from QCEW program, and reflect all jobs in the industry, not just green jobs.

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
economy cover a wide range of broader twodigit NAICS sectors as well. The eight $\$ 1,000-$ plus industries were spread across four different broad sectors: manufacturing, professional and technical services, utilities and wholesale trade. These sectors offer a good deal of variety by occupation and cover a wide range of interests and skill sets.

Consistent with the analysis of green-related clusters, the agriculture-related industry in this list, Crop production, had the lowest average wage at only $\$ 414$ per week. Administrative and support services is another detailed industry that provides many green jobs ( 2.8 percent of total green), but paid notably less than average ( $\$ 568$ weekly). Aside from these exceptions, however, the top industries in terms of
actual green jobs clearly hold the potential to impact the economy beyond direct employment by providing notable income to workers.

Figure 20 provides wage data on a more detailed set of green-related industries than the broader sectors shown in Figure 19.

The industries in Figure 20 represent the ten largest green-related sectors in terms of aggregate employment size (total jobs, not necessarily just green jobs). Each of these detailed industries has an average weekly wage in excess of the private industry average. This is an important indicator in that large industries generate large numbers of job openings, and these industries also tend to pay above average wages.

Figure 20: Annual Payroll-Per-Worker - 10 Largest Detailed Green-Related Industries - Michigan


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

Industries such as Testing laboratories and Research and development in the physical, engineering, and life sciences, pay particularly high average wages, and are examples of greenrelated sectors that are part of the knowledge economy. These sectors contain jobs requiring extensive education in mathematics, science, and
physics. However, positive wages are also likely to be available in industries requiring less extensive education such as Plumbing and heating contractors and Electrical contractors. Workers in these and other green-related sectors will still need extensive specific skills training, which will contribute to their ability to earn positive wages.


## Chapter III: Tracking Job Trends among Green-Related Firms

> The preceding section attempted to illustrate the current state of the green economy in Michigan by examining the potential industrial makeup of greenrelated jobs. This approach, however, has limitations, as many green-related industry sectors are only partially "green", and contain numerous jobs unrelated to the green economy.

This section takes an alternative approach, by focusing on a sample of specific companies known to be related to the green economy. By examining employment trends among these firms, we hope to shed more direct light on possible recent trends in the broader Michigan green economy.

Our research staff identified a sample of 358 firms in Michigan believed to be related to the green economy. This list was compiled from business directories, extensive Internet research, and other business resources.

The next step was to compile employment data on these firms from the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) database.

## Understanding the Data

An analysis of green-related business trends at the firm level offers a number of insights that the preceding chapters did not. The large DELEG employer survey did not collect historical employment data, so it could not address green-related employment trends over time. The analysis of green-related NAICS industry sectors offers some employment trend analysis, but this approach is limited because several broad industries are impacted by many economic factors unrelated to the green economy.

This section will present information on employment trends from the 358 green-related firms we have identified. The advantage of this procedure is that these firms are more closely related to the green economy. The limitation of this approach is the relatively small number of firms identified. There is no way to ensure with certainty that this sample of 358 green-related companies is representative of all green firms in Michigan. The small sample size also limits
the depth of analysis that can be offered in terms of industry and regional job trends.

## Job Trends among Green-Related Firms

Between the second quarter 2005 and the second quarter 2008, the sample of 358 green-related firms in Michigan added more than 2,500 jobs in Michigan, an impressive employment expansion of 7.7 percent. This small segment of the green economy far outpaced employment trends for the economy as a whole. During this same period, total private employment in Michigan declined an estimated 5.4 percent.

With some exceptions, it is possible to aggregate the 358 green firms, using their respective industry codes, into some of the same green-related clusters discussed in prior sections of this report (see Figure 21). As Figure 21 indicates, job growth is evident among these firms in several of these broad clusters.

For example, sample firms in the Renewable Energy Production sector added nearly 1,900 jobs from 2005 to 2008, a growth rate of 30.4 percent. Those firms in the sample identified as Miscellaneous Green Manufacturers recorded job expansion of 3.6 percent over this period, an increase of over 140 jobs. Sample firms in the Energy Efficiency cluster also registered a job gain of 2.4 percent, or nearly 300 additional positions.

The job growth that this group of green firms has enjoyed since 2005 is the result of a series of year-over-year employment gains (see Figure 22). While private industry jobs in Michigan declined annually from 2006-2008, this subset of green-related firms accomplished the reverse, adding employment each year over this period.

Figure 21: Employment Trends for 358 Green-related Firms, by Cluster

| Cluster | 2005 Jobs | 2008 Jobs | Emp. Change | \% Change |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Total Private Employment | $3,683,821$ | $3,485,775$ | $-198,046$ | $-5.4 \%$ |
| 358 Green-Related Firms | 32,533 | 35,049 | 2,517 | $7.7 \%$ |
| Clean Transportation and Fuels | 5,363 | 5,321 | -42 | $-0.8 \%$ |
| Increasing Energy Efficiency | 12,041 | 12,334 | 293 | $2.4 \%$ |
| Miscellaneous Green Manufacturing | 3,926 | 4,068 | 142 | $3.6 \%$ |
| Renewable Energy Production | 6,243 | 8,138 | 1,895 | $30.4 \%$ |
| Other | 4,960 | 5,188 | 228 | $4.6 \%$ |

*Employment data reflect 2nd quarters of 2005 and 2008 Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

It is true that much of the job expansion illustrated in Figure 21 occurred among a limited number of green-related companies that added large numbers of new jobs. Another key factor that explains the relatively positive employment trends among this group of firms is the emergence of new green-related businesses since 2005. Many of these new business establishments are small but have successfully added or retained jobs through the second quarter of 2008.

In fact, of the 358 green firms that we identified, over 70 appeared to be newly created since 2005, accounting for nearly 600 jobs by the second quarter of 2008 . However, it is notable that employment trends over this period were also positive for the non-startup businesses in the green-related sample. Employment levels for pre-existing green-related businesses in the sample (those in the database from 2005-2008) was also up by over 1,900 since the second quarter of 2005, an increase of nearly six percent. Over 180 of those firms expanded or kept employment levels even, while roughly 100 firms reduced employment.

## New Green Firms-

One fifth of green firms in the sample were new firms since 2005, suggesting strong entrepreneurial activity.


Figure 23: Yearly Employment for Pre-existing Green-related Sample Firms


## Comparison to Michigan

## Broad Industry Sectors

The sample of 358 green-related firms identified for this analysis have outperformed many of Michigan's most prominent industry sectors in terms of job creation. The primary Michigan growth sector over this period was health care, which registered solid job expansion of 6.3 percent since the second quarter of 2005 . This increase actually fell short of the 7.7 percent growth realized by this small sample of green-related businesses (see Figure 24). A number of the identified firms are concentrated in the areas of construction and manufacturing, industries that have experienced heavy employment losses of late. In spite of this, broadly speaking, this sample of green-related firms was able to outpace overall job trends recorded in Michigan across all major industry sectors.

As stated before, this is a small sample and may not be representative of the overall Michigan green economy. However, the data suggests the
possibility that green-related firms may have been more successful in adding and retaining jobs at least through the second quarter of 2008, which was a very difficult period for the state economy.

## Green-related Firm Sample by Industry

Due to the relatively small sample size, it is difficult to discuss in detail the industrial makeup of the 358 green firms represented in this analysis without breaching the confidentiality of the selected firms. However, given the nature of data produced by the Quarterly Census of Employment \& Wages, it is possible to make some broad statements.

The largest share of employment among the sample of green firms was in the area of Professional, scientific and technical services (NAICS 541), which accounted for one-fifth of employment in 2008. Much of the green-related work being done in this industry is scientific research and development in a variety of topics, including alternative energy, reductions in energy use, alternative fuels, and clean transportation.

Figure 24: Employment Change 2005-2008 Green-related Sample vs. Major Michigan Sectors


The employment data in Figure 25 for NAICS 541 does not include the green-related research and development establishments associated with the domestic nameplate automakers, which have recorded significant job loss during the current restructuring of the automobile industry.

Given the state's concentration of auto jobs, it is not surprising that a large number of jobs among these green-related sample firms were found in the transportation equipment manufacturing sector.

These firms are primarily auto suppliers, whose products and services have steadily evolved towards technologies that contribute towards increased fuel efficiency and the use of lighter weight components.

Below, Figure 25 highlights the primary industry sectors represented by our small sample of greenrelated firms. Other major industries in the sample not shown in Figure 25 include the appliance, chemical, and furniture manufacturing sectors.

Figure 25: Sample of Green-related Firms by Industry

| NAICS | Industry | 2005 Jobs | 2008 Jobs | Emp. Change | \% Change |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 358 | Green-related Firms | 32,533 | 35,049 | 2,517 | 7.7\% |
| 541 | Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services | 6,672 | 7,129 | 457 | 6.8\% |
| 336 | Transportation Equipment Manufacturing | 5,268 | 5,207 | -61 | -1.2\% |
| 423 | Merchant Wholesalers, Durable Goods | 2,602 | 2,231 | -371 | -14.3\% |
| 333 | Machinery Manufacturing | 1,402 | 1,679 | 278 | 19.8\% |
| 334 | Computer and Electronic Product Manufacturing | 809 | 1,497 | 688 | 85.0\% |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth


## Chapter IV: Michigan Green-Related Occupations

We now turn in this section to discuss a set of occupations related to the green economy. The employer survey discussed in Chapter I is a key source of occupational information, as it for the first time estimates the number of green jobs in detailed occupations in the Michigan economy. It also addresses questions regarding employer expectations regarding short-term hiring, difficulty in hiring, and unique skills.

However, existing information sources on occupations will be utilized in this section to address some additional issues not addressed by the employer survey. These sources will allow us to outline topics such as forecast job growth, the level of annual job openings, wages, educational/training requirements, potential career ladders, and skills.

## Characteristics of Occupations

Understanding the characteristics of green occupations is extremely important. When people talk about career options, they usually refer to occupations or job titles. An understanding of which occupations are considered green-related will help workforce developers and educators focus on those job titles, to ensure that the state workforce is equipped with the requisite skills for employment in the green economy. Basic information on the characteristics of green-related occupations will also assist potential jobseekers in making informed decisions about selecting and training for green jobs. Occupational information will also be vital to the economic development community, as the attraction and retention of green employers often hinges on demonstrating the quantity and quality of the regional labor pool for green jobs.

## Identifying Green Related Occupations

As previously discussed, the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth has defined five broad green sectors including (1) renewable energy, (2) energy efficiency, (3) clean transportation and fuels, (4) agriculture and natural resources
conservation, (5) and pollution prevention and environmental cleanup. A green occupation, therefore, is a job title that is directly associated with one of these core areas. Green occupations can be found across the spectrum of broad occupational categories, such as professional workers with specific skill sets directly needed by green-related firms; production, maintenance, and transportation occupations; critical occupations for small startup green-related firms, such as sales engineers or technical sales representatives; and jobs in teaching or training that will be needed to prepare the future green-related workforce.

In finalizing the list of occupations for consideration in this section, our research team performed an extensive literature review of current green job studies, reviewed prominent occupations in green industries using US staffing patterns, evaluated lists compiled by other state research groups on green-related occupations, and attended focus groups with green-related employers and training providers. Michigan research staff also established a set of assumptions to guide our decision-making on classifying job titles as greenrelated, and conducted an intensive review of the complete Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) system to identify detailed green-related occupations.

It is important to note that occupations that are mainly secondary and support in nature, and that do not require special "green-related" skills sets, (such as accountants and human resource workers), will not be included in the analysis in this section.

Through this process, 105 green-related occupations were identified (See the Appendix for the complete list of job titles). Certainly, not all jobs in these occupations are generated by green employers, but evaluating the employment and training requirements, wage rates, skill requirements, and forecast demand for these careers is important in fully understanding the characteristics of the green workforce.

## Forecasts for Green-Related

## Occupations

Every two years, the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth produces occupational employment forecasts. These forecasts use employment levels in a base year and project employment forward ten years; currently, the forecasts are based in 2006 and span through 2016. The projections use as inputs several factors including; population trends; labor force trends; industry trends, developments, and outlook; and various macroeconomic variables.

According to these projections, job levels among green-related occupations are expected to grow by
6.4 percent between 2006 and 2016. Over this period, green-related occupations should produce nearly 12,000 openings each year; 3,300 openings due to new job growth and 8,700 openings in replacement positions. The table below highlights green-related occupations that are expected to provide many employment opportunities to properly trained workers by 2016.

While many green occupations are new and emerging, the bulk of future job opportunities will naturally occur among the largest Michigan green careers. These large occupations generate significant numbers of job openings on an annual basis. As Figure 26 demonstrates, there are several examples of high and mid-skill green-related job titles that provide large numbers of annual job openings.

Of course, job openings occur for two primary reasons, actual expansion of jobs in an occupation and the need to replace existing workers who permanently leave an occupation. Although growth openings are important, in most occupations the majority of annual job openings address the need to replace existing workers who vacate jobs due to retirements, career changes, or other reasons.

Figure 26: Green-Related Occupations Projected to Offer Many Openings Through 2016

| SOC | Occupational Title | Employment |  | Annual Openings |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 2006 | 2016 | Total | Growth | Replacement |
| 37-3011 | Landscaping and Grounds Workers | 33,380 | 38,160 | 918 | 477 | 441 |
| 17-2112 | Industrial Engineers | 22,290 | 26,480 | 955 | 418 | 537 |
| 47-2111 | Electricians | 24,000 | 25,070 | 725 | 107 | 618 |
| 17-2141 | Mechanical Engineers | 24,730 | 25,970 | 660 | 124 | 536 |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters | 31,710 | 33,710 | 629 | 200 | 429 |
| 47-2061 | Construction Laborers | 27,240 | 29,330 | 414 | 209 | 205 |
| 11-9041 | Engineering Managers | 9,720 | 10,570 | 282 | 85 | 197 |
| 47-1011 | First Line supervisors, Construction trades | 13,920 | 14,770 | 280 | 86 | 194 |
| 17-2051 | Civil Engineers | 6,190 | 6,870 | 231 | 68 | 163 |
| 49-9021 | HVAC Mechanics and Installers | 8,230 | 8,890 | 210 | 66 | 144 |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth


Analyzing openings resulting from growth and replacement needs are both important.

In addition to analyzing occupations with a large number of job openings, it is also useful to look at job titles expected to post large job growth rates. Figure 27 displays some of the green-related occupations in Michigan with above-average rates of forecast employment growth.

The high-growth jobs in Figure 27 represent a mix of occupations by employment size and educational requirement. A few have a large employment base, such as Industrial engineers and Landscaping and groundskeeping workers. Engineering occupations, professional jobs, and mid-skill mechanic and laborer positions are all represented among the green-related jobs with above-average expected job
growth. The green economy is expected to create new job opportunities for workers willing to invest in appropriate educational and skills training, such as Surveyors and Environmental engineers.

## Green Occupations: Educational

 \& Training RequirementsGreen-related jobs should provide opportunities for jobseekers with a variety of backgrounds, skills, and levels of educational attainment. That is, not all green jobs are high skill research positions; to the contrary, many green jobs require mid-level skills or only moderate educational attainment or on-the-job training. The chart below highlights some selected occupations with high growth rates that require various educational levels.

As Figure 28 demonstrates, there are likely to be green-related occupations with above average employment demand in each broad level of educational attainment and training. However, it is also generally the case that occupations requiring higher levels of education, tend to have aboveaverage expected job growth rates. Among all green-related occupations, those requiring more educational background should see better growth prospects between 2006 and 2016. In fact, the median anticipated growth rate for lower educational attainment occupations is just 3.8 percent compared

Figure 27: Green-Related Occupations Expected to See High Growth Through 2016

| SOC | Occupational Title | Employment |  | Change |  |
| :---: | :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  |  | 2006 | 2016 | $\#$ | $\%$ |
|  | 22,290 | 26,480 | 4,190 | 18.8 |  |
| $17-2112$ | Industrial Engineers | 1,230 | 1,450 | 220 | 18.3 |
| $17-1022$ | Surveyors | 33,380 | 38,160 | 4,780 | 14.3 |
| $37-3011$ | Landscaping and Grounds Workers | 1,860 | 2,100 | 240 | 13.2 |
| $17-2081$ | Environmental Engineers | 2,860 | 3,220 | 360 | 12.5 |
| $17-1011$ | Architects | 690 | 770 | 80 | 11.7 |
| $17-1012$ | Landscape Architects | 6,190 | 6,870 | 680 | 11.0 |
| $17-2051$ | Civil Engineers | 1,050 | 1,160 | 110 | 10.5 |
| $17-2041$ | Chemical Engineers | 10,200 | 11,170 | 970 | 9.5 |
| $49-9041$ | Industrial Machinery Mechanics | 460 | 510 | 50 | 9.5 |
| $11-9121$ | Natural Sciences Managers |  |  |  |  |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
to 7.4 percent for moderate educational requirement jobs and 9.0 percent for high educational attainment positions.

As noted above, green-related occupations offer opportunities to job seekers with various educational backgrounds and with diverse skill sets. In addition to providing opportunities to many candidates, this also means that green-related jobs offer the potential for workers in entry level positions to advance to intermediate and potentially higher skill green jobs. That is, successful job candidates can enter one greenrelated occupation and begin to climb a career ladder to other, higher skill positions.

## Green Occupations: Career Progression

As demonstrated in the following five sample career progression examples, workers in green occupations can move up a career by completing additional academic training, job training, or licensing. The following career progressions are examples of potential career changes over time in each of the five green economy clusters. These are meant to be illustrative of an example of a career progression; certainly there are many career progressions possible in any one core area.


## Career Progression 1: Renewable Energy

As suggested above, an electrician helper could take classes beyond high school or participate in training through an employer toward a journeyman card in the electrician trade. The electrician could then, if desired, work toward an associate's degree (or a bachelor's degree). This credential, combined with past work experience, could produce a competitive candidate for a position as an electric or electronic engineering technician (or an electrical engineer). While electricians are shown as having a higher average hourly wage than individuals with associate degrees, it should be noted that the growth rate for the latter is much higher, besides being a good step in progressing to the highest paying job in this example, the electrical engineer.

## Career Progression 2: Energy Efficiency

On a green-construction site, a construction laborer may begin to obtain many construction-related and green-related skills. This worker could elect to enter a construction trade such as a carpenter. After additional work experience this tradesperson may have the necessary skills to apply for a position as a first-line supervisor. With additional formal education, he or she could become a construction manager.


## Career Progression 3: Agricultural and Natural Resources Conservation



## Career Progression 3: Agricultural and Natural Resources Conservation

The demand for farm workers and laborers with green knowledge and skills may increase as the demand for sustainable agriculture and organic methods increases. With additional years of training and work experience, laborers can take on the responsibilities of owning and operating their own farms, ranches, greenhouses, or nurseries. Eventually, upon acquiring a bachelor's degree, workers in this career progression could access supervisory or management positions that direct and coordinate the activities of workers engaged in agricultural crop production.

Career Progression 4: Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup


## Career Progression 4: Pollution Prevention and Environmental Cleanup

By inspecting and investigating sources of pollution, environmental compliance inspectors learn how to protect the public and the environment. An associate's degree allows a person to conduct laboratory and field tests to determine the level and sources of pollution as an environmental science and protection technician, while a bachelor's degree allows him or her to perform engineering duties in the prevention, control, and remediation of environmental health hazards. As with the first career progression, the associate degree level pays a lower average wage than the entry level, but it is growing at a substantially faster rate.

## Career Progression 5: Clean <br> Transportation and Fuels

No career progression may be as timely and appropriate as the potential occupational progression below. In this example, a dislocated auto worker enrolls in a two-year institution and earns an associate's degree to become an electrical technician. This credential plus prior work experience could make this person a relatively attractive job candidate. With additional education to earn a bachelor's degree, the
individual may have the requisite skills to become an industrial engineer. Dislocated workers may be eligible for job training assistance through the Governor's No Worker Left Behind Initiative, through a corporate re-training fund, through a union re-training fund, or through all three.

Today, many dislocated workers are faced with the difficult decision to keep looking for a job utilizing their existing skill sets or to update their skills and find employment in a cutting-edge, growing field. Green-related occupations do exist that build upon existing skill sets held by many Michigan manufacturing workers who have lost jobs during the current economic downturn.

As the sample career progressions illustrate, an expansion of the green economy in Michigan may have the benefit of providing the opportunity to many Michigan workers to get in the ground floor in a green-related job, and then gradually invest in training opportunities to move up a career ladder. The incentives for an individual worker from this progression can be substantial, in reducing spells of unemployment, obtaining skills needed in a potential growth industry, achieving personal goals, or earning a higher wage. As the next section shows, there is a very strong relationship between increased investments in human capital and an increased wage.


## Green Occupations: Wages

Workers employed in green-related occupations can expect to receive a wide range of wages. This is natural, considering the wide range of education and skills required of green occupations. One way to analyze the wages paid to various occupations is to look at a sample of select green-related occupations that pay a high wage, moderate wage, and lower wage.

The occupations displayed in Figure 29 represent a diverse range of careers ranging from Engineers to Ranchers to Recyclable material collectors. All these occupations have at least one thing in common: they are green-related. However, there are key differences between the types of occupations listed. One distinction is the complexity and variety of tasks workers in these occupations can expect to perform while on the job. For instance, lower wage occupations typically involve hands-on production of a green-related product or service. Moderate wage jobs often involve a wider range of tasks, including the skilled production of green-related products or services, product installation, and the maintenance of plants and buildings where green products and
services are produced. Higher wage occupations, like engineers and managers, may be involved in the processes and planning of high-skill green-related product development.

Moderate and lower skills occupations, despite a modest entry-level wage, can serve as a gateway to a green career. Dislocated workers from Michigan industrial jobs may have skill sets needed in certain green-related occupations.

Figure 30 suggests a strong positive correlation between higher levels of educational attainment and higher wages. Green-related occupations that require higher levels of education pay, on average, $\$ 15$ per hour more than green-related occupations that require lower levels of education. The occupations in Figure 30, below, highlight wage rates among selected green occupations with various educational requirements.

As Figure 30 shows, as educational requirements for jobs increase, so do general wage levels. While this trend is true for the selected occupations in Figure 30 , it is also true for green-related occupations as a whole. For example, the median wage for greenrelated job titles requiring a bachelor's degree or higher is $\$ 33.62$, compared to $\$ 22.59$ for green jobs

Michigan Green Jobs Report 2009

Figure 29: Select High, Median, and Low Wage Green Occupations

| Wage | SOC | Occupations | Employment | Hourly Wage | Annual Salary |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Higher | 11-9041 | Engineering Managers | 9,720 | \$52.93 | \$110,090 |
|  | 11-9021 | Construction Managers | 8,680 | \$44.21 | \$91,950 |
|  | 41-9031 | Sales Engineers | 3,870 | \$40.33 | \$83,900 |
|  | 41-4011 | Technical and Scientific Products Sales Representatives | 11,280 | \$37.61 | \$78,230 |
|  | 17-2141 | Mechanical Engineers | 24,730 | \$37.02 | \$77,010 |
| Moderate | 47-2111 | Electricians | 24,000 | \$27.18 | \$56,530 |
|  | 17-3023 | Electrical and Electronic Engineering Technicians | 4,240 | \$24.14 | \$50,210 |
|  | 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning, and Refrigeration Mechanics | 8,230 | \$22.22 | \$46,230 |
|  | 11-9011 | Farm, Ranch, and Other Agricultural Managers | 11,630 | \$26.38 | \$54,870 |
|  | 47-2152 | Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters | 15,060 | \$26.08 | \$54,240 |
| Lower | 47-2061 | Construction Laborers | 27,240 | \$16.87 | \$35,100 |
|  | 53-7081 | Refuse and Recyclable Material Collectors | 3,350 | \$15.36 | \$31,960 |
|  | 51-2022 | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers | 5,290 | \$14.51 | \$30,170 |
|  | 37-3011 | Landscaping and Groundskeeping Workers | 33,380 | \$11.71 | \$24,350 |
|  | 45-2092 | Farmworkers and Laborers, Crop, Nursery, and Greenhouse Workers | 28,680 | \$10.05 | \$20,900 |

Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
requiring an associate's degree, vocational training, or significant work experience and $\$ 20.22$ for greenrelated workers with lower levels of educational attainment.

These averages clearly demonstrate the wage premium for 4 -year degree jobs, and yet the roughly $\$ 20$ average wage for other green-related jobs is still quite high. This is because many of the green-related occupations selected for this analysis that do not require a 4 -year degree still require postsecondary education or extensive on-the-job training. It is these skill requirements that can impact wage rates. Additionally, many of these moderate skill greenrelated occupations are in the construction and manufacturing industries, sectors that generally produce above average wage rates.

## Green Occupations: Critical Skills and Knowledge Sets

What about the skills and knowledge components of green-related occupations? The results of the focus groups can help us answer this question. Focus group employers emphasized that a certain green context will be needed in a variety of jobs. Focus group employers frequently said that their current workers need more green knowledge, reinforcing the idea that unique green skills are an incremental, necessary addition to a worker's current skill set in most cases. This finding implies that employees who increasingly find themselves working on "green" projects may require additional training, either in the workplace, or through formal educational opportunities, and


Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
potential new workers hoping to transition from existing industries into the green economy may need to secure additional education before making that transition. The survey finding that managers of all sorts and business specialists will require green skills reinforces the point that a general understanding of the green context is necessary for successful execution of green projects. For example, focus group employers in construction described the need for a site supervisor to understand the general green context of working on a LEED building, while crew members involved in rehabilitation or restoration work needed to change patterns of behavior when required to salvage or save working appliances such as sinks for recycling, rather than putting them in the dumpster.

Despite the need for some specialized skills, employers have stressed that workers still need the basics. Green skills are an overlay of new skills and knowledge; and learners cannot access the new knowledge without the requisite foundation. Many green jobs are current jobs with an additional green focus; far fewer green jobs are a full new set of knowledge and skills.

In addition, since many employers indicated in the focus groups that they were looking for skills such as communication, bookkeeping, marketing, and other core business functions, their talent demands encompass a much more diverse set of skill sets. Employers in the agriculture and sustainable food systems focus groups explicitly referenced the business skill sets farmers need to produce, package, and sell their goods, such as accounting, marketing, food safety regulations, and financing.

Another way to help understand the skills and knowledge workers need in the green economy is to look at a few specific green-related occupations and their key skills and knowledge sets from the O*NET skills database. ${ }^{5}$ The tables present several relevant labor market indicators for each occupation. The occupations highlighted in the boxes below represent green-related job titles with various skill and knowledge levels.

Green "practices" are ways of working that minimize damage to the environment (e.g., minimizing material waste, picking up all construction waste at a job site, and taking waste to recycling).

Green "knowledge" is understanding concepts such as which materials can be recycled in which ways, awareness of opportunities to implement green practices, and the ability to apply concepts to new situations.

Green "skills" are those which actively contribute to environmental improvement, such as energy auditing, installing insulation, working with new materials, and so forth.


[^3]| Engineering Teachers |  |
| ---: | :--- |
| 2006 Employment: | 1,360 |
| Anticipated Growth: | $17.5 \%$ |
| Annual Openings: | 47 |
| 2007 Wage: | Variable |

Educational Requirement: Doctoral degree Critical Skills

| Critical Skills |  |
| :---: | :--- |
| Critical Thinking | Highly Important |
| Active Learning | Highly Important <br> Mathematics <br> Science <br> Speaking |
| Highly Important |  |
| Critical Knowledge |  |
| Highly Important |  |
| Highly Important |  |

The first two boxes, above, reflect occupations with above average educational requirements. These are examples of the so-called "knowledge" jobs that are a key component of the green economy. They also have several advanced skill and knowledge areas that are highly important for success in these occupations. In both instances, these occupations pay a high wage and are expected to see impressive growth rates. It is important to note, however, that these higher-level green-related occupations require significant investments in education and professional development.

The next two boxes, right, reflect mid-level positions requiring on-the-job training. As expected, the mix of key skill and knowledge sets differ from many of the green-related jobs requiring college degrees. They also contain more of a mix of skills and knowledge ranked by the O*NET system from "Highly Important" through "Somewhat Important". In both instances, these occupations pay a moderate to high wage and are expected to see average growth rates and a medium level of annual openings.

| Environmental Engineers |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 2006 Employment: | 1,860 |
| Anticipated Growth: |  |
| Annual Openings: |  |
| 2007 Wage: | $13.2 \%$ |
| (\$36.21 |  |

These occupations can also be distinguished from the occupations above because they do not require as significant an investment in education and training. Workers can attain the requisite skills for employment in these occupations through worksitebased training.

The last box features a typical occupation in the automotive industry, assemblers and fabricators. This occupation pays a solid wage, but is expected to see very negative job loss of - 16.3 percent from 2006-2016. Many of these positions are traditional production occupations . . . the kind of jobs Michigan has been rapidly losing. Former workers in these occupations will be considering alternative career options in Michigan, and many may already have some basic skills that could be used when transitioning into a green-related occupation. In some instances, displaced workers from these occupations may have resources available to them to assist in the pursuit of additional on-the-job training, an associate's degree from a local community college, or a bachelor's degree from a university.

| Sheet Metal Workers |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| 2006 Employment: | 4,960 |
| Anticipated Growth: | 4.5\% |
| Annual Openings: | 145 |
| 2007 Wage: | \$24.59 |


| Construction Laborers |  |
| ---: | :--- |
| 2006 Employment: | 27,240 |
| Anticipated Growth: | $7.7 \%$ |
| Annual Openings: | 415 |
| 2007 Wage: | $\$ 16.87$ |

Educational Requirement:
Moderate-term on-the-job training
Critical Skills

| Active Listening | Important |
| :--- | :--- |
| Coordination | Important |
| Equipment Selection | Important |
| Speaking | Important |
| Instructing | Somewhat Important |

## Critical Knowledge

| Building and Construction | Highly Important <br> Important |
| :--- | :--- |
| Design | Important |
| Mathematics | Somewhat Important |
| Mechanical | Somewhat Important |
| Public Safety and Security |  |


| Potential Transitional Careers for Dislocated <br> Assemblers and Fabricators |
| :--- | :--- |
| Sheet Metal Workers |
| Construction Laborers |
| Roofers |
| Chemical Equipment Operators |
| Grounds Maintenance Workers |
| Farmworkers and Laborers |
| Electrical / Electronic Equipment Assemblers |
| Semiconductor Processors |
| Electrician Helpers |
| Engine / Machine Assemblers |
| Hazardous Materials Removal Workers |

Which critical knowledge and skill sets are Michigan focus group employers saying are hard to find?
$\checkmark$ Safety knowledge
$\checkmark$ Mechanical aptitude
$\checkmark$ Ability to do non-computerized drawing (manual)
$\checkmark$ Ability to read blueprints
$\checkmark$ Know "what" to draw as well as "how" to draw
$\checkmark$ Basic machine design skills
$\checkmark$ Adaptability
$\checkmark$ Understanding green standards and guidelines
$\checkmark$ Material recycling awareness
$\checkmark$ Systems Specialization (solar, wind, geo-thermal, rain water, etc...)
$\checkmark$ Environmental impact knowledge
$\checkmark$ MIOSHA Training
$\checkmark$ Communication skills
$\checkmark$ Marketing and general business management skills
$\checkmark$ Visual relationship aptitude
$\checkmark$ ISO 14000 certified

Source: Focus Groups with Michigan Employers,
February - March, 2009

## Conclusion


#### Abstract

The results of the Michigan Green Jobs Study reveal the vast potential awaiting Michigan and its residents as we transform to a green economy. We defined green jobs as those direct and support jobs that are related to a firm's green related revenue. We found through our analytical approach that, even in the downturn in Michigan's economy over the last four years, some specific industries are continuing to show substantial job growth.


Our finding that a subset of green related firms experienced job growth rates in excess of other broad industry sectors like healthcare, strongly suggests (but does not guarantee) that green related firms, especially those in the renewable energy area, are well positioned to ride through the economic downturn and help drive the green economy growth in Michigan. And we hear from our Michigan employers through the survey these key facts:

- There are 109,067 green jobs in Michigan- both direct and support jobs.
- $40 \%$ of direct green jobs are in Clean Transportation and Fuels, and engineers are a major occupational force in this area.
- Green skills are a vital additional skill set needed by employees, but many jobs are ripe for transitioning to becoming "greener," along with the workers in those jobs.

The results of this study provide a comprehensive baseline from which to measure Michigan's green economy growth. It is to that future we now turn.

## Public Policy and Green Jobs

While it is impossible to determine the exact relationship between public policy and job creation, recent developments at the local, state and national levels may accelerate Michigan's already healthy green job growth in the coming months.

- Michigan's adoption of a renewable portfolio standard is likely to increase investment in alternative energy production. Already, the
state has seen an increase in interest in manufacturing wind turbines in Michigan.
- The requirement within the recent energy legislation that the state's regulated utilities spend an increasing portion of their revenues on energy efficiency measures for their industrial, commercial and residential customers will create a fund of $\$ 275$ million for energy efficiency work by 2012.
- The Michigan Legislature has enacted incentives for advanced energy storage, strongly supporting development of a concentrated development of that industry in the state. Already, several firms in this field have made commitments to locate and grow in Michigan.
- DELEG has launched a $\$ 6$ million Green Jobs Initiative, focused on helping industries cited in this report develop the workforce skills they will need to succeed.
- Substantial components of the American Reinvestment and Recovery Act provide funding to accelerate development of green jobs spanning renewable energy production, increasing energy efficiency of buildings, and developing new energy transmission grids.


## What the Future Holds:

The opportunity to create new Michigan jobs rests overwhelmingly with the clean energy, green-collar economy. With our advanced manufacturing expertise, our depth of engineering talent, and our local access
to original equipment manufacturers (OEMs) and suppliers, we are poised to create tens of thousands of good-paying green jobs for Michigan workers.

In November 2008, Governor Granholm reorganized what was Michigan's Department of Labor and Economic Growth into the new Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth, a move that boldly underscored the Governor's desire to create a strategic alliance uniting energy, workforce and economic growth. By realigning energy resources under DELEG and redefining the Director as the Chief Energy Officer for the State, the Governor put additional emphasis on reinvigorating this segment of Michigan's economy.

## Renewable Energy Area

In the renewable energy sector, Michigan has the potential to become a regional and global powerhouse in wind turbine manufacturing. With Michigan's engineering expertise and modernized machining, our state is uniquely positioned to meet the booming global demand for wind turbines and wind turbine components. Michigan is already a leader in the area of solar technology, but these companies currently ship most of their product overseas. DELEG's goal is for Michigan to capture the entire value chain for solar, including development, advanced manufacturing of solar arrays and panels, project development and design, and all aspects of solar deployment.

## Energy Efficiency

Investments in energy efficiency represent a major opportunity for Michigan to create jobs, save money, and reduce our reliance on fossil fuels. In fact, energy efficiency creates more jobs per dollar than fuel-based solutions. By replacing traditional fossil fuel energy, Michigan's energy efficiency program will save Michigan over \$3 billion in electricity costs over the next 20 years and help to avoid the need for construction of additional baseload power plants.

## Batteries

Advanced energy storage, and in particular the production of lithium ion batteries for cars, holds enormous potential for job creation in Michigan. While Asian firms currently have a head start in the advanced battery market, Michigan is rapidly becoming a center for advanced energy storage innovation aimed at, among other things, electrifying the automobile. We can get Michigan moving again by growing this sector, and by connecting an appropriately trained workforce to these high-tech green jobs.

We know that the powerful combination of policy efforts and private sector activity will be vital to Michigan's future. The determination, energy, and passion for the future that our businesses, workers, and educational institutions provide are the building blocks of this exciting transformation.

## For More Information-

Bureau of labor Market Information
\& Strategic Initiatives
Labor Market Analysis Section
3032 W. Grand Boulevard, Suite 9-100
Detroit, MI 48202
(313) 456-3100

WWW.MICHIGAN.GOV

## Appendix 1 - Survey

## STATE OF MICHIGAN GREEN JOBS SURVEY

## ABOUT THE SURVEY

The State of Michigan strives to diversify its economy through business development in new sectors such as renewable energy and energy efficiency. This effort includes supporting development of business sectors and jobs in areas such as wind energy, biofuels, solar energy, energy efficiency, and other "green-related" sectors.

The Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth has been directed to conduct this survey to determine the current number of jobs in these sectors, and also among businesses that supply parts, components, products, or services to support these sectors. The survey will identify jobs that produce goods or services related to any of the following five core green-related activities:

1. Producing renewable energy
2. Increasing energy efficiency
3. Clean transportation and fuels
4. Agriculture and natural resource conservation
5. Pollution prevention and environmental cleanup

Please see the enclosed handout that gives specific definitions of these sectors and examples of the green-related jobs they supply.
If your firm conducts "green-related" business activities that produce goods or supply services related to any of these five core areas, please complete the information below and continue to page two. If not, please fill out Section 1 and Section 2 below and return using the postage-paid envelope.

## DIRECTIONS AND SURVEY RESPONSE OPTIONS

- Please direct this survey to your operations manager or human resources department.
- Include information about the Michigan business location listed in the lower left-hand corner of this form.
- All information will be treated confidentially.
- Return the survey in the enclosed postage-paid envelope, or
o Fax both sides to (800) 794-6424, or
- Contact us toll free at (888) 587-3282 to report by telephone or receive answers to your questions.
- Questions can also be emailed to us at greenjobssurvey@michigan.gov
- To ensure inclusion of your information, please respond to this survey by February 27, 2009.


## Section 1

Do you or any of your staff work to provide goods or services in any of the above five core green-related areas?
$\qquad$ Yes Please complete Sections 2-3 on this page and Sections $4-5$ on the reverse side.
$\qquad$ No Please provide us with contact information below in Section 2, and mail survey in postage paid envelope, or fax survey back to (800) 794-6424


## Section 3 <br> PLEASE REPORT FOR THE MICHIGAN BUSINESS LOCATION SHOWN IN THE LOWER LEFT-HAND CORNER OF THIS FORM

How many employees do you currently have at this location in Michigan?

How many of these are employees whose primary function is the production of "green-related" products and services?

How many of these are employees who hold support jobs for your "green-related" business activities?

How many of these are employees engaged in business functions unrelated to your "green" business activities?

THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING!
Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth
Bureau of Labor Market Information \& Strategic Initiatives
3032 West Grand Boulevard, Suite 9-100
Detroit, MI 48202
DELEG is an equal opportunity employer/program.
Quantity: 6,233; Cost: \$1,087.66 (\$0.1745 per copy); Printed 2-09




## Appendix 2 - Survey Methodology

## Sample Selection:

The sampling frame for the survey was the Quarterly Census of Employment and Wages (QCEW) database. This database contains Michigan companies liable under the Unemployment Insurance Compensation system.

The sampling frame was further limited to private establishments in 691 6-digit NAICS codes. These 6digit NAICS industries included a subset of 118 greenrelated industry sectors identified by the research team. 46 broad and detailed industries were excluded

| Sample Summary | Number of <br> Establishments |
| :--- | :--- |
| Population of Establishments | 121,279 |
| Final Sample Size | 13,303 |
| Number of Firms in-Sample | 13,132 |
|  | Number of <br> Establishments |
| Total in and out of Sample, by Reason |  |
| Reason Code | 6,434 |
| Responses | 94 |
| Refuse to respond | 3 |
| Invalid Addresses | 86 |
| Out of Business | 6 |
| Out of State | 65 |
| Nonresponse | 9 |
| Unusable Response | 2 |
| Inactive |  |
|  | 13,132 |
| Response Rate | 6,434 |
| Number of Firms in Sample | $49.0 \%$ |
| Total Response | $89.6 \%$ |
| Response Rate | $10.4 \%$ |
| Percentage of Establishments |  |
| with or without green jobs |  |
| With Green Jobs |  |
| Without Green Jobs |  |

from the sampling frame based on an expected lack of green-related employment.

The sample was divided into strata. This stratification was conducted by 3-digit NAICS code, by seven Michigan regions, and by seven employment size classes. Firms within each stratum were selected through random sampling except establishments with $250+$ employees. These were selected with certainty and had a selection probability of 1.0.

## Survey Data Collection

The survey instrument was mailed to 13,303 private employers in Michigan in the first quarter of 2009. Employers who did not respond to the survey mailing were contacted by telephone to collect survey responses. Data collection reflected in the survey estimates was conducted over a six week time period.

## Estimate Production

Employers reported employment by job title by core green activity area (see copy of survey form in Appendix). These job titles were coded by occupation using the Standard Occupational Classification system.

Once coded, survey responses were weighted based on each stratum's share of sample units to total universe establishments, and then multiplied by a non-response adjustment factor. These adjustments converted survey counts of green jobs by job title into estimates of total green jobs by occupation.

## Appendix 3 - Definition of Green Jobs and Core Areas Sent to Employers

## State of Michigan Green <br> Jobs Survey Definitions

The green economy is comprised of businesses that offer products or services related to renewable energy, increased energy efficiency, clean transportation and fuels, agriculture and natural resource conservation, and pollution prevention or environmental cleanup.

Green jobs include primary occupations engaged in the production of green-related products or services, and support jobs created by green-related revenue.

## POTENTIAL CORE GREEN-RELATED ACTIVITIES

- Producing renewable energy, renewable energy parts and equipment, or supplying related products or services.
o Renewable energy is energy generated from sustainable, natural resources that can be naturally regenerated in the short-term, such as:
- Sunlight (solar)
- Wind
- Water (hydro)
- Geothermal heat
- Biomass (wood and wood waste, agricultural and energy crops \& associated residues, animal waste, municipal solid waste, food products \& processing waste)
o Related businesses include those:
- Producing renewable energy
- Firms that make or supply parts or equipment used in energy collection and distribution, such as solar panels or wind turbines
- Conducting research and development on renewable energy technologies, or providing consulting assistance to renewable energy providers
- Increasing energy efficiency
o Energy efficiency encompasses all changes that result in a reduction of the energy used for a given energy service (i.e., space heating, lighting, etc.) or level of activity. Examples include businesses involved with:
- Insulation of residential and commercial buildings
- Retrofitting of homes to reduce energy consumption
- "Green" building design or implementing LEED standards
- Downsizing or upgrading of HVAC, lighting and other energy systems in buildings, which reduces energy demand
- Production of energy efficient household appliances, such as a refrigerator or dryer
- Providing engineering, consulting or research services on operations, materials, or technologies that improve energy efficiency
- Clean transportation and fuels
o Clean transportation refers to the research, development, and production of new technologies for energy storage and alternative fuels, as well as the engineering of improved fuel efficiencies and emissions reductions. Examples of these activities include:
- Advanced batteries
- Fuel cells
- Electric and hybrid vehicles
- Alternative fuels
- Public transit
- Activities related to meeting fuel efficiency standards, and more.
- Agriculture and natural resource conservation
o Agriculture and natural resource conservation refers to products or services designed to help conserve, maintain, and improve natural resources and the environment.
o Low carbon agriculture consists of agricultural technologies that produce energy with little or no CO 2 emissions, and can also include other conservation practices that help remove $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ or related emissions from the atmosphere. Examples include:
- No till conservation tillage
- Organic farming
- Community supported agriculture (CSA)
- Methane capture in animal and/or food waste management
- Planting trees or grasses
o Natural resource conservation includes businesses involved with:
- Forest and land management
- Water conservation
- Environmental consulting services
- Environment, conservation, and wildlife organizations
- Pollution prevention and environmental cleanup
o Pollution prevention refers to products that are designed to have minimal impacts on human health and the environment, and services that eliminate or reduce the amount and toxicity of potentially harmful substances at their source. Examples include:
- Controlling industrial and commercial emissions
- Water treatment
- Recycling center operation
- Waste treatment
o Environmental cleanup consists of businesses that provide services or products related to:
- Environmental remediation
- Brownfield redevelopment
- Hazardous waste cleanup
- Wetlands restoration


## Appendix 4 - List of Green Related Industries Reflected in Chapter II

| NAICS | Industry Title |
| :--- | :--- |
| 111110 | Soybean Farming |
| 111140 | Wheat Farming |
| 111150 | Corn Farming |
| 111421 | Nursery and Tree Production |
| 111422 | Floriculture Production |
| 111991 | Sugarbeet Farming |
| 111998 | All Other Miscellaneous Crop Farming |
| 113110 | Timber Tract Operations |
| 113210 | Forest Nursery/Gathering Forest Products |
| 113310 | Logging |
| 115114 | Postharvest Crop Activities (except Cotton Ginning) |
| 115310 | Support Activities for Forestry |
| 221111 | Hydroelectric Power Generation |
| 221119 | Other Electric Power Generation |
| 221121 | Electric Bulk Power Transmission |
| 221122 | Electric Power Distribution |
| 221210 | Natural Gas Distribution |
| 221310 | Water Supply and Irrigation Systems |
| 221320 | Sewage Treatment Facilities |
| 221330 | 98145.452 |
| 236115 | New Single-Family Housing Construction (except Operative Builders) |
| 236116 | New Multi-Family Housing Construction (except Operative Builders) |
| 236117 | New Housing Operative Builders |
| 236118 | Residential Remodelers |
| 236210 | Industrial Building Construction |
| 236220 | Commercial and Institutional Building Construction |
| 237110 | Water and Sewer Line and Related Structures Construction |
| 237130 | Power and Communication Line and Related Structures Construction |
| 238151 | Glass and Glazing Contractors - Residential |
| 238152 | Glass and Glazing Contractors - Nonresidential |
|  | Roofing Contractors -Residential |
|  | Roofing Contractors -Nonresidential |


| NAICS | Industry Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 238171 | Siding Contractors - Residential |
| 238172 | Siding Contractors - Nonresidential |
| 238211 | Electrical Contractors and Other Wiring Installation Contractors - Residential |
| 238212 | Electrical Contractors and Other Wiring Installation Contractors - Nonresidential |
| 238221 | Plumbing, Heating, and Air-Conditioning Contractors - Residential |
| 238222 | Plumbing, Heating, and Air-Conditioning Contractors - Nonresidential |
| 238311 | Drywall and Insulation Contractors - Residential |
| 238312 | Drywall and Insulation Contractors - Nonresidential |
| 238911 | Site Preparation Contractors |
| 321113 | Sawmills |
| 321911 | Wood Window and Door Manufacturing |
| 321920 | Wood Container and Pallet Manufacturing |
| 321999 | All Other Miscellaneous Wood Product Manufacturing |
| 322121 | Paper (except Newsprint) |
| 325199 | All Other Basic Organic Chemical Manufacturing |
| 325211 | Plastics Material and Resin Manufacturing |
| 325311 | Nitrogenous Fertilizer Manufacturing |
| 326113 | Unlaminated Plastics Film and Sheet (Except Packaging) |
| 327215 | Glass Product Manufacturing Made of Purchased Glass |
| 327993 | Mineral Wool Insulation Materials Manufacturing |
| 332321 | Windows and Doors, Metal, Manufacturing |
| 333411 | Air Purification Equipment Manufacturing |
| 333414 | Heating Equipment except Warm Air Furnaces |
| 333415 | Air-Conditioning, Warm Air Heating Equip., \& Commercial \& Industrial Refrigeration Equip. |
| 333611 | Turbine Generator and Generator Set Units |
| 334413 | Semiconductor and Related Devices |
| 334419 | Other Electronic Component Manufacturing |
| 334512 | Automatic Environmental Control Manufacturing |
| 334513 | Industrial Process Variable Instruments |
| 334519 | Measuring and Controlling Devices |
| 335110 | Electric Lamp Bulb and Part Manufacturing |
| 335121 | Residential Electric Lighting Fixtures Manufacturing |
| 335122 | Commercial, Industrial, and Institutional Electric Lighting Fixture Manufacturing |
| 335129 | Other Lighting Equipment Manufacturing |
| 335221 | Household Cooking Appliance Manufacturing |
| 335222 | Household Refrigerator and Home Freezer Manufacturing |
| 335224 | Household Laundry Equipment Manufacturing |
| 335228 | Other Major Household Appliance Manufacturing |
| 335311 | Power Distribution and Specialty Transformer Manufacturing |


| NAICS | Industry Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 335312 | Motor and Generator Manufacturing |
| 335313 | Switchgear and Switchboard Apparatus Manufacturing |
| 335314 | Relay and Industrial Control Manufacturing |
| 335911 | Storage Battery Manufacturing |
| 335999 | All Other Miscellaneous Electrical Equipment Component Manufacturing |
| 336111 | Automobile Manufacturing |
| 336311 | Carburetor, Piston, Piston Ring, and Valve Manufacturing |
| 336312 | Gasoline Engines and Engine Parts |
| 336350 | Motor Vehicle Transmission \& Power Train Components |
| 336360 | Motor Vehicle Seating and Interior Trim |
| 336391 | Motor Vehicle Air-Conditioning Manufacturing |
| 336399 | All Other Motor Vehicle Parts Manufacturing |
| 336412 | Aircraft Engine and Engine Parts Manufacturing |
| 336991 | Motorcycle, Bicycle and Parts Manufacturing |
| 423610 | Electrical Apparatus and Equipment, Wiring Supplies Wholesalers |
| 423930 | Recyclable Materials Merchant Wholesalers |
| 482111 | Line-Haul Railroads |
| 485111 | Mixed Mode Transit Systems |
| 485113 | Bus Transit Systems |
| 485119 | Other Urban Transit Systems |
| 485210 | Interuban \& Rural Bus Transportation |
| 485999 | All Other Transit \& Ground Passenger Transportation |
| 486210 | Pipeline Transportation of Natural Gas |
| 541310 | Architectural Services |
| 541320 | Landscape Architectural Services |
| 541330 | Engineering Services |
| 541360 | Geophysical Surveying and Mapping Services |
| 541370 | Other Surveying and Mapping Services |
| 541380 | Testing Laboratories |
| 541420 | Industrial Design Services |
| 541614 | Process and Logistics Consulting Services |
| 541618 | Other Management Consulting Services |
| 541620 | Environmental Consulting Services |
| 541690 | Other Technical Consulting Services |
| 541712 | Research and Development in the Physical, Engineering, and Life Sciences (except Biotechnology) |
| 562111 | Solid Waste Collection |
| 562112 | Hazardous Waste Collection |
| 562119 | Other Waste Collection |


| NAICS | Industry Title |
| :--- | :--- |
| 562211 | Hazardous Waste Treatment and Disposal |
| 562212 | Solid Waste Landfills |
| 562219 | Other Nonhazardous Waste Treatment and Disposal |
| 562910 | Remediation Services |
| 562920 | Materials Recovery Facilities |
| 562998 | All Other Miscellaneous Waste Management Services |
| 712130 | Zoos and Botanical Gardens |
| 712190 | Nature Parks and Other Similar Institutions |
| 813312 | Environment, Conservation and Wildlife Organizations |

## Appendix 5 - List of Green Related Occupations Reflected in Chapter IV

| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :--- | :--- |
| $11-9011$ | Farm, Ranch, and Other Agricultural Managers |
| $11-9012$ | Farmers and Ranchers |
| $11-9021$ | Construction Managers |
| $11-9041$ | Engineering Managers |
| $11-9121$ | Natural Sciences Managers |
| $13-1041$ | Environmental Compliance Inspectors |
| $17-1011$ | Architects, Except Landscape and Naval |
| $17-1012$ | Landscape Architects |
| $17-1021$ | Cartographers and Photogrammetrists |
| $17-1022$ | Surveyors |
| $17-2021$ | Agricultural Engineers |
| $17-2041$ | Chemical Engineers |
| $17-2051$ | Civil Engineers |
| $17-2071$ | Electrical Engineers |
| $17-2072$ | Electronics Engineers, Except Computer |
| $17-2081$ | Environmental Engineers |
| $17-2111$ | Health and Safety Engineers, Except Mining Safety Engineers and Inspectors |
| $17-2112$ | Industrial Engineers |
| $17-2131$ | Materials Engineers |
| $17-2141$ | Mechanical Engineers |
| $17-3022$ | Civil Engineering Technicians |
| $17-3023$ | Electrical and Electronic Engineering Technicians |
| $17-3025$ | Environmental Engineering Technicians |


| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :--- |
| $17-3026$ | Industrial Engineering Technicians |
| $17-3027$ | Mechanical Engineering Technicians |
| $17-3031$ | Surveying and Mapping Technicians |
| $19-1012$ | Food Scientists and Technologists |
| $19-1013$ | Soil and Plant Scientists |
| $19-1023$ | Zoologists and Wildlife Biologists |
| $19-1031$ | Conservation Scientists |
| $19-1032$ | Foresters |
| $19-2031$ | Chemists |
| $19-2032$ | Materials Scientists |
| $19-2041$ | Environmental Scientists and Specialists, Including Health |
| $19-2042$ | Geoscientists, Except Hydrologists and Geographers |
| $19-2043$ | Hydrologists |
| $19-3051$ | Urban and Regional Planners |
| $19-3092$ | Geographers |
| $19-4011$ | Agricultural and Food Science Technicians |
| $19-4031$ | Chemical Technicians |
| $19-4091$ | Environmental Science and Protection Technicians, Including Health |
| $19-4093$ | Forest and Conservation Technicians |
| $25-1031$ | Architecture Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1032$ | Engineering Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1041$ | Agricultural Sciences Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1042$ | Biological Science Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1051$ | Atmospheric, Earth, Marine, and Space Sciences Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1052$ | Chemistry Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1053$ | Environmental Science Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1054$ | Physics Teachers, Postsecondary |
| $25-1064$ | Geography Teachers- Postsecondary |
| $25-9021$ | Farm and Home Management Advisors |
| $27-1021$ | Commercial and Industrial Designers |
| $33-2022$ | Forest Fire Inspectors and Prevention Specialists |
| $33-3031$ | Fish and Game Wardens |
| $37-3011$ | Landscaping and Groundskeeping Workers |
| $37-3013$ | Tree Trimmers and Pruners |
| $37-3019$ | Grounds Maintenance Workers, All Other |
| $41-4011$ | Sales Reps, Whls//Mfg, Technical/Scientific Products |
| $45-2031$ | Sales Engineers |
| 451 | Agricultural Inspectors |
| Graders and Sorters |  |
| Farmworkers and Laborers, Crop, Nursery, and Greenhouse |  |
| Agricultural Workers, All Other |  |


| SOC | Occupational Title |
| :---: | :---: |
| 45-4011 | Forest and Conservation Workers |
| 45-4021 | Fallers |
| 45-4022 | Logging Equipment Operators |
| 45-4023 | Log Graders and Scalers |
| 47-1011 | First Line supervisors, Construction trades |
| 47-2031 | Carpenters |
| 47-2061 | Construction Laborers |
| 47-2111 | Electricians |
| 47-2121 | Glaziers |
| 47-2131 | Insulation Workers, Floor, Ceiling, and Wall |
| 47-2132 | Insulation Workers, Mechanical |
| 47-2152 | Plumbers, Pipefitters, and Steamfitters |
| 47-2181 | Roofers |
| 47-2211 | Sheet Metal Workers |
| 47-3013 | Helpers - Electricians |
| 47-4011 | Construction and Building Inspectors |
| 47-4041 | Hazardous Materials Removal Workers |
| 47-4071 | Septic Tank Servicers and Sewer Pipe Cleaners |
| 49-2095 | Electrical and Electronics Repairers, Powerhouse, Substation, and Relay |
| 49-3043 | Rail Car Repairers |
| 49-3091 | Bicycle Repairers |
| 49-3093 | Tire Repairers and Changers |
| 49-9021 | Heating, Air Conditioning \& Refrigeration Mechanics \& Installers |
| 49-9041 | Industrial Machinery Mechanics |
| 49-9051 | Electrical Power-Line Installers and Repairers |
| 51-2022 | Electrical and Electronic Equipment Assemblers |
| 51-2031 | Engine and Other Machine Assemblers |
| 51-8012 | Power Distributors and Dispatchers |
| 51-8013 | Power Plant Operators |
| 51-8021 | Stationary Engineers and Boiler Operators |
| 51-8031 | Water and Liquid Waste Treatment Plant and System Operators |
| 51-8091 | Chemical Plant and System Operators |
| 51-8092 | Gas Plant Operators |
| 51-9011 | Chemical Equipment Operators and Tenders |
| 51-9141 | Semiconductor Processors |
| 53-3021 | Bus Drivers, Transit and Intercity |
| 53-4011 | Locomotive Engineers |
| 53-4021 | Railroad Brake, Signal, and Switch Operators |
| 53-4031 | Railroad Conductors and Yardmasters |
| 53-6051 | Transportation Inspectors |
| 53-7081 | Refuse and Recyclable Material Collectors |

DELEG is an equal opportunity employer/program. Auxiliary aids, services and other reasonable accommodations are available upon request to individuals with disabilities.


[^0]:    1 As of February 2009, seasonally unadjusted private jobs for Michigan totaled 3,227,600 according to data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth, Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives, Current Employment Statistics program.

[^1]:    3 All respondents did not report the number of green jobs by core area or by occupation. For this reason, table columns may not always sum to the total count of green jobs.
    4 As of February 2009, seasonally unadjusted private jobs for Michigan totaled 3,227,600 according to data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth, Bureau of Labor Market Information and Strategic Initiatives, Current Employment Statistics program.

[^2]:    Source: Michigan Department of Energy, Labor \& Economic Growth

[^3]:    5 A skill or knowledge is labeled "Highly Important" if the O*NET ranking index is between 70 and100; "Important" if between 60 and 69 ; and "Somewhat Important" if the index was below 60.

